

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
THURSDAY JUNE 21, 2012

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a regular meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held on June 21, 2012 at 10:07 a.m., 232 Boulevard of the Allies, Pittsburgh, PA 15222-1616. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Linda Judson, Gabe Mazefsky, Christopher D'Addario and Fauna Solomon. Present from staff were: David Onorato, Anthony Boule, Christopher Speers, Judi DeVito, Jo-Ann Williams, Chris Holt, Wes Pollard, Patricia Konesky, Janet Staab, Bill Conner and Nick Gentile. Jacqui Lazo of Buchanan Ingersoll & Rooney arrived at 10:15 a.m. Also present were William Stewart of Strategic Communications; Joe Smydo of the Pittsburgh Post Gazette; Bob Bauder of the Pittsburgh Tribune Review and Jonathan Vlasic of Alla Famiglia Ristorante.

MINUTES

Ms. Judson asked for approval of the minutes from the regular meeting held on May 17, 2012.

Upon motion by Mr. D'Addario and seconded by Mr. Mazefsky the minutes were approved as follows: Ms. Solomon, yes; Mr. D'Addario, yes; Mr. Mazefsky, yes; Ms. Judson, yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. Judson asked for public comments.

Mr. Vlasic, owner of Alla Famiglia Ristorante, located in the Allentown section of the city, thanked the Board for allowing him speak at today's meeting. He distributed a letter to the Board and the Executive Director asking for their consideration of his offer to purchase the Asteroid Way lot located immediately next to his restaurant. He advised that the restaurant has been in that location since 1997, and said he took ownership in 2005 and has made sizeable investments in the building and said he feels that purchasing the lot would benefit his business immensely. He stated that if he were to purchase the lot with his restaurant currently open in the evening hours only, he would allow the community to utilize the lot during the daytime until 4:00 p.m., compliments of Alla Famiglia. Mr. Vlasic advised that he is an active advocate for the community, in which he also chose to live, and said he sees a turnaround for the very depressed area. He stated that the purchase of the lot would help his business by affording safe, no-cost, convenient parking for his patrons, but at the same time he would give back to the community by improving the landscaping and lighting and also by allowing his neighborhood daytime businesses to use the lot at no cost. Mr. Vlasic advised that he is limited

on parking for patrons as he does not have access to the lot behind his building nor the one on its opposite side. He also stated that he is in Allentown to stay, as evidenced by his purchase of a home there.

Mr. Onorato thanked Mr. Vlasic for his interest and advised that he and the Board would consider his request and will get back to him with their decision.

Mr. Vlasic asked that this decision be made before the Authority proceeds with placing new multi-space meters in the lot.

Mr. Onorato advised that we do have an existing procedure in place for purchasing property from the Authority and said that we will follow that procedure and will be in touch with Mr. Vlasic with the Board's decision.

Mr. Vlasic thanked Mr. Onorato and the Board for their time and consideration.

RESOLUTIONS

RESOLUTION NO. 25 OF JUNE 2012, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO SOLICIT PROPOSALS FOR THE PURCHASE OF SECURITY CAMERA EQUIPMENT FOR VARIOUS OFF-STREET GARAGE FACILITIES AND LOTS, was read by Mr. D'Addario and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this represents an expansion of revenue control procedures at Authority facilities, noting that the last two garages built included a camera system in the construction designs. He advised that the camera system is basically for the public areas, including the lobby, pay stations locations, and the entry and exit areas. Mr. Onorato said it is used also for tracking the cash in the manager's office and around the safe and to assist the managers and attendants when a customer rings the help button so that visual coverage of the entry/exit areas is immediately available. He advised that seven of our 13 facilities currently have a camera system but said some of those are very outdated. Mr. Onorato advised that we are asking for permission to solicit bids and, based on the response price levels, to determine which facilities we are able to equip. He added that the priorities at this time would likely be the Mellon Square, Ninth and Penn and Smithfield/Liberty garages but stated that the cost and type of system chosen would determine the number of facilities we would be able to include.

Ms. Judson asked for confirmation that these cameras would cover the entrance and exit areas, the booths and the areas where money is handled.

Mr. Onorato confirmed that this was correct. He noted that these cameras are not the type that are monitored on a daily basis but said we are able to look at the tapes after the recording period if the need arose.

Mr. D'Addario asked if the seven camera systems currently installed in the facilities

connect to each other and if the images could be viewed from the main office.

Mr. Onorato said the camera systems are not connected to each other but stand alone and the images cannot be viewed from the main office. He said that it was necessary to go on site to view each facility's recordings.

Mr. D'Addario asked if there was any consideration of upgrading the entire system. He stated that with technology changing so much over the past few years, there should be a way to connect all of the systems.

Mr. Onorato agreed that this would be the way to proceed but said that we would need to stay within our budget. He stated that we could proceed in this manner at the facilities we choose to upgrade at this time, but also make it a policy to include the connective function going forward when upgrading other facilities.

Mr. D'Addario asked if the only areas that are being monitored at the facilities where we currently have camera equipment are the entry and exit lanes and the lobby areas.

Mr. Onorato confirmed Mr. D'Addario's impression and stated we particularly try to track the flow of the money.

Ms. Judson stated that she agreed with Mr. D'Addario on the need to have a more sophisticated system depending upon the cost, and stated that she would welcome a legal opinion as to whether having that type of monitoring system would expand our liabilities. She stated that having knowledge and notice of 24-hour activity by having someone actually sit and observe monitors could increase liability.

Mr. Onorato stated that he thinks there may be some misunderstanding of Mr. D'Addario's suggestion regarding a technology upgrade that would enable the Authority to retrieve and review video recordings from the main office as opposed to having to go to each individual facility. He said Mr. D'Addario's comment was not in support of a 24-hour-a-day monitoring system.

Mr. Mazefsky asked for confirmation that the Authority would be bringing their recommendations back to the Board before proceeding.

Mr. Onorato confirmed that the recommendation would be brought to the Board for approval before proceeding.

Ms. Judson asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. D'Addario and seconded by Mr. Mazefsky, Resolution No. 25 of 2012 was approved as follows: Ms. Solomon, yes; Mr. D'Addario, yes; Mr. Mazefsky, yes; Ms. Judson, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 26 OF JUNE 2012, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH THE EAST LIBERTY DEVELOPMENT, INC. (ELDI) TO LOWER THE HOURLY RATES IN 2 PPAP LOTS IN EAST LIBERTY NEIGHBORHOOD AS A PILOT PROGRAM FOR A 4 (OR 6) MONTH PERIOD AS AN OFF-STREET VS. ON-STREET METER RATE TEST, was read by Mr. D'Addario and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority has been working with East Liberty Development Inc. to develop a pilot program using the Sheridan/Kirkwood and Sheridan/Harvard lots in an attempt to move more vehicles from on-street metered spaces to those locations.

Mr. Onorato circulated a map showing the existing PPAP lots in the East Liberty neighborhood as well as one identifying Authority-owned property in that area that has been sold.

Mr. Onorato advised that our current lot meter rate throughout the city, including the two involved in this pilot program, is \$1.00 per hour. He noted that the street meter rate in East Liberty is \$.75 per hour and said that both the Authority and ELDI believe that the street rate should be higher than the lot rate, adding that both organizations prefer that long-term parkers use the surface lot to free up more on-street spaces for turnover and availability in the streets. He stated that by lowering the rates in the lot below the street rate, we would be able to judge the impact of price on parking location.

Mr. Onorato stated that ELDI will guarantee the Authority any lost revenue during this pilot program.

Mr. Onorato stated that the Authority's intent after the pilot program is to return the lot rates to their original level and then work with City Council to adjust the street rates because, if the pilot works, they will need to be adjusted at the time the lot rates are reduced.

Ms. Solomon asked if there will be any advertising of this pilot program.

Mr. Onorato advised that we will work with ELDI, which is active in the community, to advertise the pilot effort.

Mr. Mazefsky added that ELDI did include a marketing program in their proposal.

Ms. Judson asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. D'Addario and seconded by Mr. Mazefsky, Resolution No. 26 of 2012 was approved as follows: Ms. Solomon, yes; Mr. D'Addario, yes; Mr. Mazefsky, yes; Ms. Judson, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 27 OF JUNE 2012, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH (THE "AUTHORITY") TO TAKE CERTAIN ACTIONS RELATED TO THE CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW PUBLIC PARKING GARAGE IN THE DOWNTOWN AREA OF THE CITY OF PITTSBURGH, was read by Mr. D'Addario and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority has been working with representatives from both the City and URA regarding the possible purchase of the Saks Fifth Avenue site with the URA for development of a new public garage facility. He advised that the URA currently has site control of two additional properties on the proposed garage footprint as well as an agreement on a necessary third property. He advised that the URA is ready to sign a contract for the purchase of the site for approximately \$4 million and will be doing its due diligence over a six-month period. He advised that staff is seeking authorization to proceed with financial, parking, traffic and environmental studies to be completed during that six-month period. Mr. Onorato said the resolution is to authorize issuance of the necessary RFP's, adding that vendors' responses to them would be brought back to the Board for approval.

Mr. D'Addario said he is in support of this addition and said that the Authority and the Board should not only be looking at operating maintaining the existing facilities but also to expand and add new ones.

Mr. Onorato added that this is an ideal site, centrally located in the heart of downtown.

Mr. D'Addario added that with parking in the City getting more challenging and the downtown residential population increasing, and seeing both Grant Street and First Avenue revenues proceeding upward, he believes adding additional spaces is a move in the right direction.

Mr. Onorato advised that this resolution also requests approval for the Authority to sign a Memorandum of Understanding with the URA for this project.

Ms. Judson said the development in and around that area will result in more employees who will be seeking parking. She added that the changes we anticipate seeing in public transportation, will lead to more people car-pooling, citing that are another reason to provide additional parking downtown.

Mr. Onorato advised that part of the study will include transportation issues beyond the facility as there is currently a bus lane that may need to be reconfigured or relocated. He added that PNC just purchased the building across the street from this site and Oxford Development will be completing a project near the proposed garage as well.

Mr. Mazefsky stated that the Mellon Square garage, catty-cornered from this site currently operates above capacity and said PNC will be adding 800 new employees to that garage's immediate service area. He said there have been studies dating back to the 1940s and as recent as this year stating that we have not met the demand for parking in this corridor. Mr. Mazefsky commented that this project is exciting and said he believes that it will bring additional opportunities to this site. He stated that our partnership with the URA will permit exploring other possibilities on this same piece of land.

Mr. Onorato distributed a footprint of the site detailing the Saks building as well as the three additional parcels involved.

Ms. Judson commented that once again the Authority is on the cutting edge of progress in the city.

Ms. Judson asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Mazefsky and seconded by Mr. D'Addario, Resolution No 27 of 2012 was approved as follows: Ms. Solomon, yes; Mr. D'Addario, yes; Mr. Mazefsky, yes; Judson, yes.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato updated the Board that the contract with CALE has been signed and executed for the upgrade of the meter technology. He advised that the field work for identifying the placement of the machines and signage is underway and said a complete order had been placed with the first shipment anticipated to arrive July 11, 2011. He advised that the machines will be completely built and programmed once they arrive in Pittsburgh prior to the installation that is scheduled to begin by the end of July.

Mr. Onorato advised that he had previously circulated a copy of the amended By-Laws for the Board's review and stated that he would re-circulate them by the end of this week. He advised that this topic will be on July's Board meeting agenda, at which time they would be amended and updated to comply with the Authority's current size, scope and mission.

Mr. Onorato advised that the repair projects recently authorized by the Board for deck repairs at the Ft. Duquesne and Sixth and Smithfield/Liberty garages have begun. He said Smithfield/Liberty is losing approximately 147 spaces per day, equating to a loss of about \$2000 to \$2500 in revenue per day. He reported that Ft. Duquesne is losing approximate 142 spaces per day or from \$1,700 to \$2,000 in daily revenue lost.

Mr. Onorato noted that the monthly reports showed an increase in the daily collection report for street meters and noted this was due to the rate increase which included comparisons from May 2011 to May 2012. He reminded the Board that the rate increases did not occur until June 2011

and January 2012, noting that the May 2012 numbers included the impact of those two rate increases.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Garage Facilities Revenue report showed an increase and said it was attributed to the Mon Wharf not experiencing the amount of closures that it did last year.

Mr. Onorato advised that garages such as Grant Street and First Avenue are seeing an increase in utilization as well as Forbes Semple, which had experienced a decline when Children's Hospital relocated from Oakland to Lawrenceville.

Mr. Onorato said he wanted to clarify a statement that was made at last month's Board meeting during which he reported that the CALE contract had a \$390,000 yearly operating expense when in fact it was a one-time expense over the life of the seven-year contract.

Ms. Solomon asked if the meter installation program was going to begin in Market Square.

Mr. Onorato advised that the current anticipated installation schedule is to begin on the North Shore, then move to South Side Works and then Oakland. He advised that Market Square was included in the Downtown component which would occur after the three mentioned areas.

Ms. Solomon asked if there was a project date for completion of the entire project.

Mr. Onorato advised that we anticipate having all new CALE machines installed by mid-September.

Mr. Onorato asked if there were any additional question regarding the monthly reports.

There were none.

OLD/NEW BUSINESS

Ms. Judson asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

The next Board meeting is scheduled for Thursday, July 19, 2012 at 10:00 a.m.

Upon motion by Mr. D'Addario and seconded by Mr. Mazefsky the meeting was adjourned at 10:31 a.m.

APPROVED TO CONTENT


Chairman

ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF
MINUTES


Approval