## MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH THURSDAY OCTOBER 19, 2023

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a virtual meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:03 a.m. on October 19, 2023. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Bobby Palmosina, Bobby Wilson, Sean Luther and Liz Fishback. Present from staff were David Onorato, Christopher Speers, Scott McNaugher, David Perry, Matt Jendrzejewski, Karla Howell, Jodi Hart, Karla Turzak, Matt Engleson, Anide Michel, Tracy Sowinski and Patricia Konesky. Also present were Nathan Clark of Buchanan, Ingersoll & Rooney and Alison Keating.

Mr. Onorato announced that a new member was appointed to the Board of Directors, Mr. Sean Luther, who is present at today's meeting, and asked each departmental director to introduce themselves to Mr. Luther. Introductions were made.

Ms. Fishback welcomed Mr. Luther to the Board stating that we are happy to have him.

## **MINUTES**

Ms. Fishback asked for approval of the minutes from the September 21, 2023, meeting.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Palmosina the minutes were approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

## **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any public comments.

There were none.

## EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato advised the Board on a follow up from last month's meeting regarding a member of the public who spoke about the Parking Authority delaying a response to her right to know

request. He advised that our office reached out to her after the meeting and she stated that her right to know request was sent to the City as she believed that we all under one roof, and apologized for saying it was the Parking Authority's failure to respond.

Mr. Onorato followed up on the question from last month's meeting regarding the footnote on the Parking Court report which noted that ticket issuance was down and revenue were up and asked for an explanation. Mr. Onorato advised that the ticket issuance was down for the month of October, and the revenue numbers included prior months, a month which also included a boot eligibility notification which often encourages payment therefore increasing revenues.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Quarterly Finance Report, advising that the revenues compare 2023's to 2022 and that we have kept 2019's as a base year marker for pre-covid. He advised that September 2023's revenues were \$4.2 million, an increase from last year's \$3.7 million, but still an approximately \$600,000 decrease from 2019's \$4.8 million. He advised that while revenues are trending in the right direction, they are still below 2019's. He advised that revenues through September 2023 are \$34.3 million and September 2022 was \$30.8 million and 2019's revenues were \$43.8 million. He advised that to-date revenues are off approximately \$9.5 million. He advised that the 2023 year to date budget for 2023 is \$30.7 million and advised that it was very difficult projecting revenues coming out of the pandemic.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Garage Revenue Report, advising that year-to-date revenue in the garages totaled \$19.9 million with all garages showing an increase with the exception of Wood-Allies and Forbes-Semple which are having rehabilitation work completed and the Grant Street Transportation Center Garage which is currently only utilizing the blue garage to handle all of the parking needs and not operating the red garage. He advised that the red garage would open to accommodate any increases in events at the Convention Center.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement Ticket Report, which shows that ticket issuance increased from 19,400 in September 2023 up from 18,800 in September 2022, advising that meter, residential permit parking and street cleaning violations account for approximately eighty percent of the total tickets issued. He also advised that the year-to-date total tickets increased by 18,269, which is good as we are still having issues with hiring into the enforcement positions.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Revenue Reports, stated that meter revenue is returning faster to the pre-pandemic levels than the garage revenues. He advised that the revenues for September 2023 were \$1.6 million compared to September 2019's pre-pandemic's \$1.7 million. He noted that The number of lot leases remains down from the pre-covid level of 367 to the current 313.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report, noting that the revenues for 2023 through September are \$7.4 million, last year's \$5.9 and 2019's revenues of \$8.2 million. He advised that the project share of revenues to the City, after expenditures and the operating deficit of \$353,430 through September is \$5.4 million. He reminded the Board that the City receives 100-percent of the net revenues minus the operating deficit for the Residential Permit Program.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Garage Utilization Report, noting that the average utilization rate

across the system is 70 percent which is an increase from the 60 to 62 percent where it remained for a long-time post-pandemic and noted that pre-pandemic levels were consistently at 98 percent capacity.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Downtown Housing Lease Report, noting that there was an increase over the last quarter with the majority of those leases being in Mellon Square and First Avenue Garages. Mr. Onorato advised that these leases are for residents of downtown and they receive a thirty-seven and a half percent discount which is the rate of the parking tax.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Meter Revenue Report, which shows the breakdown of payment type for meter transactions, which is 1.9 percent by coin; 35 percent by credit card; and 62 percent by mobile payment.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Facility Revenue, which shows the revenue per space in 2023 at \$1,460 per space compared to 2022's \$1,176 per space. He advised that the top three revenue generating garages are Smithfield/Liberty, Mellon Square and Oliver. He noted that prior to the construction at the Forbes-Semple Garage it was one in the top three category.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Pay-By-Phone Report, which shows 293,408 transactions are made using the mobile apps in 2023 with 2,758,107 transactions year-to-date.

Mr. Onorato asked if there were any questions or concerns.

Mr. Luther asked if violations for the Smart Curb are being captured by camera or by enforcement agents.

Mr. Onorato advised that this program in currently on hold and no tickets are being issued for this violation at this time. He advised that we are hold until additional community meetings are held.

RESOLUTION NO. 30 OF OCTOBER 2023, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING FREE PARKING FOR TRANSIENT CUSTOMERS ON "SMALL BUSINESS SATURDAY", NOVEMBER 25, 2023, AT ALL AUTHORITY-OWNED METERED LOTS AND ON-STREET MEERS. was read by Ms. Fishback and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority would like to support Small Business Saturday throughout the City, and as we have in the last several years, offer free transient parking at the meters and in our metered neighborhood surface lots on Small Business Saturday.

Ms. Fishback asked for clarification that this is just for metered parking spaces, not in

residential permit parking areas.

Mr. Onorato confirmed that its only at meters and that residential permit parking will remain enforced according to each individual district's signage.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, Resolution No. 30 of 2023 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

## RESOLUTION NO. 31 OF OCTOBER 2023, "A RESOLUTION ACKNOWLEDGING MS. DEBRA (MINNIE) MEYER FOR HER 22 YEARS OF PROFESSIONAL AND EXEMPLARY SERVICE IN HER EMPLOYMENT WITH THE PITTSBURGH PARKING AUTHORITY, was read by Ms. Fishback and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that Ms. Meyer has recently retired, and the Authority would like to acknowledge Minnie for her work at the Authority. He advised that she has been a fixture at the First Avenue Garage and the Second Avenue Lot for most of her career stating that she is very customer friendly and some of our customers have already sent inquiries concerning her whereabouts since her retirement and not visible everyday. He advised that she will be missed and we wish her well in her retirement and in her years going forward. Mr. Onorato asked Mr. Speers if he would like to add any comments as her direct supervisor.

Mr. Speers stated that Ms. Meyer is a very kind soul, and she will be sorely missed by our team. He advised that she was the welcoming face at the Second Avenue Lot for years and she greeted every customer as they entered the lot. He advised that there are many Allegheny County and City employees that utilize this lot and he stated that he has received many inquiring emails and said that they are happy to hear that she is happily retired.

Ms. Fishback stated that on behalf of the Board of Directors they wish Minnie well in her retirement.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Luther, Resolution No. 31 of 2023 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

# RESOLUTION NO. 32 OF OCTOBER 2023, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO PURCHASE TWO (2) LEVEL II DUAL HOSE ELECTRIC VEHICLE CHARGING STATIONS FOR THE WOOD-ALLIES PARKING GARAGE, was read by Ms. Fishback and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority recently purchased its first two electrical vehicles and while there are about 35 EV charging spaces throughout our system, we do not have any charging stations at the Wood-Allies Garage, which is where our fleet vehicles are stationed. He advised that we are currently taking those vehicles to Third Avenue Garage to be charged. He advised that we will be using the Sourcewell State Contract No. 042221 for this purchase totaling \$18,000.

Mr. Luther asked the difference between a fleet level charger costing \$9,000, which he understands is a commercial level, versus a home unit charger that is much cheaper.

Mr. Speers advised that the EV Charges that are across the system are all Level II because they are able to fully charge a vehicle in about four hours. He advised that we like to turn these spaces over as quickly as possible. He also added that this purchase is dual chargers so there are four charging points which may be a contributing reason for the higher purchase cost.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, Resolution No. 32 of 2023 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 33 OF OCTOBER 2023, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE FINAL PAYMENT TO PULLMAN SST, FOR LIMITED SCOPE OF REPAIRS AT THE WOOD-ALLIES PARKING GARAGE, was read by Ms. Fishback and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this work was for roof level full and partial depth repairs at the Wood-Allies Garage. He advised that the original contract was for \$73,385 and there was one change order for \$18,372.11 making the final cost of the total contract \$491,757.11. He advised that there was 13-percent participation for MBE/WBE for subcontractors totaling just under \$60,000

and 4-percent participation for skilled labor totaling \$18,000. He advised that the Authority is requesting authorization to release \$49,175.11 as final payment to Pullman SST as the work has been completed to the Authority's satisfaction.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, Resolution No. 32 of 2023 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

### OLD BUSINESS

Ms. Fishback asked if there was any old business.

There was none.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any new business matters to discuss.

Mr. Onorato again welcomed Mr. Luther to the Board and advised that we will be scheduling a meeting to give him an overview of the Authority and stated that we will let all Board members know of the meeting date and would be happy if any of them would like to participate.

Ms. Fishback stated that she would like to have the Board meetings in person at least once a quarter beginning inf 2024 and said this could be discussed over the next few months. She noted that she will keep in mind Mr. Wilson's Council schedule.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any additional new business matters to discuss.

There were none.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:34 a.m. with all the Board expressing their approval.

## APPROVED TO CONTENT



## ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF MINUTES

13.1

Approval