

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
THURSDAY MARCH 21, 2024**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a virtual meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:03 a.m. on March 21, 2024. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Liz Fishback, Bob Wilson, Bobby Palmosina and Sean Luther. Present from staff were David Onorato, Chris Holt, Christopher Speers, Jodi Hart, Jo-Ann Williams, Kathryn Van Why, Matt Jendrzejewski, Karla Howell, Tracy Sowinski, Matt Engleson, Denise Moschak, Bob Wilson and Patricia Konesky. Also present were John Small and Alison Keating. Nathan Clark of Buchanan, Ingersoll & Rooney joined at 10:11 a.m.

MINUTES

Ms. Fishback asked for approval of the minutes from the February 15, 2024, meeting.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, the minutes were approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any public comments.

There were none.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that City Council passed the ticket by mail legislation and he thanked Councilman Wilson and the city administration for their support and stated that the legislation is awaiting the Mayor's signature. Mr. Onorato advised that our vendor is proceeding with the necessary software integration in place that will enable us to issue tickets-by-mail. He advised that this process may take several months and that our goal is to utilize the process during the street cleaning program this year, as well in the PED areas.

He stated that Pittsburgh is one of the first cities, if not the first, to implement ticket-by-mail for on-street parking at the meters.

Ms. Fishback asked that after the legislation is signed would the Authority need to update the public and at what point will we see representation of those numbers and when will they show up in the monthly reports.

Mr. Onorato responded that our goal is to have this implemented and running by the end of June. He advised that the news media covered this very well as the process moved through the council process and noted that the public has been made aware of this coming. He also noted that pilot programs with ticket-by-mail have been on going in two of our lots located in the South Side and that we have been issuing live tickets for the last few weeks and we have not had any public issues in response to this process. He advised that we have seen tickets issued in this manner being paid as well as contested, but those being contested were not due to the way the ticket was issued. He advised that we would inform the public when we begin the street cleaning process using ticket-by-mail.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that Parking Court recently sent boot and tow notices to approximately 3,000 owners whose vehicles are boot eligible.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the street cleaning program for the city will begin April 1st and that the Authority staff and the pertinent city representatives met to discuss the implementation of the program.

Mr. Onorato advised that there are conflicts with the dates of the April and May board meetings and advised that we will be reaching out to members for their availability to reschedule.

Mr. Onorato asked the Board for their authorization to allow the Audit Committee, which consists of Ms. Fishback and Mr. Luther and Finance staff members, to be able to accept the audit from our external auditors as long as the Audit Committee is ok with the report. He said if the Board approves this action that he will notify them that it was accepted.

Mr. Wilson, Mr. Palmosina, Mr. Luther and Ms. Fishback voted to support this recommendation and allow the Audit Committee to accept the audit.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that our enforcement and garage staff is adequately staffed to support the influx of visitors in the area for the NCAA Tournament.

Ms. Fishback thanked Mr. Onorato and staff and Mr. Wilson for the efforts they undertook at both the state and local level to bring the ticket-by-mail program to fruition.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on the Finance Report, stating that 2024 revenues for February were \$4.1 million compared to last year's \$4.7 million. He advised that 2019 base year was \$4.9 million with a delta of about \$400,000. He advised that the 2024 year-to-date revenue was \$7.9 million compared to last year's \$7.2 million and 2019's base year being \$9.1 million

with the delta still being \$12 million. He noted that our budget is \$7.9 million for 2 months and we are right on budget with our 2024 projections. He advised that expenses for the month of February were \$3.3 million, which is up slightly from last year, but still down from 2019 where it was \$4.1 million.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Facility Reports, noting that the numbers compare to the Finance Report, noting that only facility to see a decline from 2023 to 2024 was the Grant Street Transportation Center Garage and he advised that this is due to the red garage remaining closed. He advised that currently the blue garage has enough capacity to handle the parking needs. He advised that revenues are up 8.1 % from last year, but still slightly off pace from 2019. He advised that the year-to-date revenues are showing the same trend occurring with Shadyside Garage joining Grant Street with a dip in revenues, which he attributes to the closure of some of the businesses on Walnut Street.

Mr. Luther asked if the year over year variance is due to the red garage being closed as he believes it to be a great facility in a good location and in good condition.

Mr. Onorato responded that Convention Center events directly affect the garage utilization and since the Covid pandemic their events are not as large as they once were. He also advised that the garage is not seeing volume from the patrons of the Strip District as it is a little further removed from the business district in the Strip.

Mr. Luther also made note that there was a commercial lease customer that cancelled a large number of leases at the Grant Street facility.

Mr. Speers mentioned that in addition to losing 130 leases that were held by Bombardier, now know as Alstrom, some of the events at the Convention Center were not as large as in the past. He noted as an example that the Home and Garden show typically runs ten days, and we typically get an overflow of vehicles of approximately 150 vehicles, but this year we only saw that overflow to be approximately 25 vehicles. He also noted that the timing of the events affects the need for parking.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement Report, advising that there 33,500 tickets issued in 2024 year-to-date slightly less than the 34,000 issued in 2023 with meter and residential permit parking violations making up 78 % of the violations for the month of February. He noted that with street cleaning beginning next month we will see and increase in that ticket category.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report, advising that the revenues for February 2024 are \$741,000 compared to 2023's \$705,000 and year-to-date revenues being \$1.439 million in 2024 and \$1.432 million in 2023. He noted that it is still early in the year but advised that the numbers are trending in the right direction.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority received a final audit report from the City Controller's office and the area they touched upon the most was that the Authority is doing everything it can to combat the loss of revenues due to the Covid pandemic.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board that the Authority signed an agreement with the Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership and is working with the city to create public restrooms at the Smithfield/Liberty Garage. He advised that we are continually meeting with the city, PDP and the Unions involved, and stated it is not going as smoothly as anticipated. He advised that the intent was to encourage families and non-residents to come downtown and have public restrooms available, but we are not seeing that type of usage, we are seeing more of the unhoused population using it and noted that there are some concerns resulting from their usage. He advised that the Teamsters Local No. 926 does not see this working well and they would like to see this stopped immediately as some of the incidents that are occurring have us concerned for the safety of our employees and patrons. He advised that we continue to monitor the situation.

Mr. Luther asked is the request to make the restrooms available for public use came from The Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership or from the city administration through the PDP.

Mr. Onorato responded that the original request came through the city but that we would enter the contract through the PDP as they would be responsible for maintaining and staffing the restrooms from 7:00 am to 11:00 pm, the hours which it is open.

Mr. Wilson stated that he had the understanding that because the two bathrooms, referred to as the Pittsburgh Potty, were closed, that two of the restrooms located in the garages that the Authority owned, would be used as public restrooms, but thought that Mr. Onorato may have believed something different as people seemed to be surprised as to who is using the restrooms.

Mr. Onorato advised that there have been on-going meetings with city administration, the PDP and the Teamsters Union. He advised that the PDP staff is responsible for maintaining and servicing the restrooms and at this point we believe that our staff is doing more than was contracted in addition to a number of patrons contacting us to cancel their leases as they feel opening the restrooms to the public has put them in an unsafe situation.

Mr. Wilson asked whose responsibility it was to staff and clean the restrooms.

Mr. Onorato responded that it is the employees of the PDP through the clean and sweep team and advised that those ambassadors are employees of the SEIU Union employees.

RESOLUTION NO. 9 OF MARCH 2024, "A RESOLUTION ACKNOWLEDGING MRS. MARY ELLEN SCHNURR UPON HER RETIREMENT, was read by Ms. Fishback and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato thanked Mrs. Schnurr for her years of dedicated service. He advised that Mrs. Schnurr began her employment as a janitor in 1995 and was promoted to garage manager in 1999 where she remained until her retirement. He advised that her most recent assignment was at the Ft. Duquesne and Sixth Street Garage, which is one of our largest and most active facilities due to its location in the Theater District. Mr. Onorato stated that Mrs. Schnurr was good at overseeing and managing the garage and stated that our customers often commented on the appearance and cleanliness of the facility. He advised that she also built a good relationship with customers and co-workers. He stated that both he and the patrons, most of which she knows by name, would be sad to see Mrs. Schnurr leave, thanked her for the work she had done and wished her the best in her future endeavors.

Mr. Speers added that Fort Duquesne and Sixth Garage is one of our top 3 garages and this garage can fill during the day and then because of its location can fill again in the evening. He said Mrs. Schnurr has done a fabulous job managing this facility and she is going to be greatly missed. He also thanked her for extending her retirement day by 30 days to help the Authority while it was transitioning with its new revenue control equipment which was recently installed at the garage.

Ms. Fishback, on behalf of the Board, thanked Mrs. Schnurr for her years of service and for extending her retirement date to assist with staff training with the new technology.

Mr. Speers advised that Mrs. Schnurr was not able to be present on today's meeting as she is currently battling the flu.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any additional questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, Resolution No. 9 of 2024 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 10 OF MARCH 2024, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO AWARD A CONTRACT TO CARL WALKER CONSTRUCTION, INC. FOR THE REPAIRS & PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE AT THE MELLON PARKING GARAGE", was read by Mr. Wilson and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that based on our capital improvements program this is the last facility over the past few years that we are completing major repairs on. He advised that based on the annual inspection reports from an outside firm it was determined that this garage needed structural repairs. He advised that we retained a structural engineer to determine the scope of work, which

we then put out to bid, which resulted in 5 bids being received with the lowest responsible bid being submitted by Carl Walker construction in the amount of \$5,232,522.00 with the funds for repairs to be taken from the Capital Improvement Fund. Mr. Onorato advised that the garage is a 6 level, below grade parking structure with the necessary repairs being identified in the 2022 annual inspection report. He advised that the project includes the development of the engineering spec and construction drawings, and the scope of work being very detailed and involved and include structural concrete repairs to floor slabs, ceiling columns, walls and beams, removal and replacement of waterproof membrane system, painting of walls, columns and beam and ceiling and the installation of code compliant guard rails systems, replacing existing floor drains and related drain stacks and stair tower repairs. He advised that the estimated timeframe for project completion is 18 months once they mobilize. He advised that there is a 16 % MWDBE participation in this project, which was unanimously approved by the City's Equal Opportunity Review Commission.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Luther, Resolution No. 10 of 2024 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 11 OF MARCH 2024, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE A CHANGE ORDER TO PSX, INC. FOR THE PARKING ACCESS & REVENUE CONTROL SYSTEM (PARCS), was read by Mr. Luther and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that they previously awarded a contract for the replacement of the revenue control equipment at 5 of our garage facilities and inadvertently during our analysis we forgot to include the secure bike location at the Third Avenue Garage, the only facility where we have a secured bike area that is revenue producing. He advised that this change order is being initiated by the Authority as we would like to have this added with the new technology just installed in the garage.

Ms. Fishback asked why this is the only location where the Authority has a secured revenue producing bike area.

Mr. Speers advised that sometime around 2011 the Authority was approached by Bike Pittsburgh who was looking through our facilities to see where they could do a free public area that was secure for bike parking and the only garage that really worked was the Third Avenue Garage due to the style of the facility. He stated that there is an area in that garage that is a dead non-revenue generating area and together Bike Pittsburgh and the Authority secured matting, bike racks, lockers and fencing to create a secure accessed area for bike parking. He stated that historically

there are about 15 people who use that facility on a daily basis and this amount is not full capacity.

Mr. Luther added that since 2012 when this area was established, many of the office buildings added secure bicycle parking at their facilities and he can see why the demand has not increased.

Ms. Fishback asked if it was worth looking to see if additional areas can be identified for bike parking.

Mr. Onorato responded that we can reassess but stated that he doesn't believe there is currently a demand for bike parking in the facilities.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Wilson, Resolution No. 11 of 2024 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 12 OF MARCH 2024, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO PURCHASE LAPTOPS AND ACCESSORIES FROM CDW GOVERNMENT, was read by Ms. Fishback and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority is continually upgrading its computer systems and will allow the Authority to function fully remotely if the need ever arises again. He noted that we do replace the equipment on a rotating basis to limit large costs for replacement should they be replaced at the same time. He advised that this purchase would be made using the Co-Stars contract through an approved vendor.

Mr. Wilson asked if the Board has authorized this type of purchase previously and if this was the second or third installment. He also inquired if office workers have a desktop or a docking station at their workplace, noting that \$75,000 does not seem like a lot of money if we were competing a large conversion.

Mr. Onorato responded that the Board did authorize purchase of computers last year but that was to purchase additional laptops, not replacements. He also replied that most of the employees have laptops in their office and some still have desktops. He stated that this is part of our capital improvement program that replaces computers incrementally.

Mr. Wilson asked why type of equipment was being purchased, laptops or tablets, and if the Authority would be leases or buying out right. He also suggested that we connect with the City IT Department regarding their experiences with different equipment.

Mr. Onorato responded that this will be a purchase not a lease and that he could not speak to the exact model type being purchased but stated that when our IT Director returns from vacation, we can update the Board.

Mr. Perry stated that he has been testing some of the equipment for IT and he believes that we are looking at a surface laptop or Lenovo.

Ms. Fishback asked if the Authority had a plan for the old laptops.

Mr. Onorato advised that we are considering offering them at a discounted rate to employees after they are wiped clean.

Ms. Fishback advised that the company she works for does offer to sell them to employees.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, Resolution No. 12 of 2024 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 13 OF MARCH 2024, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ENTER PHASE II WITH PSX, INC. FOR PARKING ACCESS & REVENUE CONTROL SYSTEM (PARCS) FOR THE ADDITIONAL FIVE (5) AUTHORITY-OWNED GARAGES, was read by Mr. Wilson and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Board previously approved replacing the revenue control equipment at 5 of our garages and 4 of those have been completely renovated with the last of those garages currently underway and should be completed by the end of the month. He advised that our intention was to upgrade all garages with the same operating system for more efficiency. He advised that part of that contract was to implement Phase 2 as long as Phase 1 was completed on time and to the Authority’s satisfaction. He advised that we are asking the Board for permission to proceed with Phase 2 at a cost not-to-exceed \$1,319,000 with the funds coming from the Capital Improvement and Operating Funds.

Ms. Fishback asked for the completion timeline of Phase 2.

Mr. Onorato advised that the equipment needs to be ordered and shipped to the local PSX Office and once the equipment is on-site and programmed it will take approximately 2 weeks each to install in each facility.

Mr. Holt added that with any unforeseen issues we anticipate the end of the year's third quarter for all facilities to be upgraded.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Luther, Resolution No. 13 of 2024 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

OLD BUSINESS

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any old business matters to discuss.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the Authority experienced an issue in 2022 when there was construction on Ft. Pitt Blvd. being completed by Columbia Gas and their contractor, they inadvertently broke an electrical line, which wasn't the Authority's, and as a result of that action, the Public Utilities Commission (PUC) fined the Authority with fines and penalties. Mr. Onorato stated that with the assistance of Mr. Clark and his firm Buchanan, Ingersoll and Rooney, we testified in front of the PUC resulting in the waiving of all fines and penalties and dismissed the case against the Authority.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any additional old business matters to discuss.

There were none.

NEW BUSINESS

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any new business matters to discuss.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that representatives from the City of Chicago have reached out to us and will be visiting the Authority to see and learn more about our meter operations.

Ms. Fishback responded that this is very exciting and congratulated the Authority.

Ms. Fishback asked the Board members to please respond promptly to the request for the reschedule for the April Board meeting.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any additional new business matters to discuss.

There were none.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:53 a.m. with all the Board expressing their approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT

DocuSigned by:
Elizabeth Fishback
1878ED52F74E42D...
Chairman

ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF MINUTES

DocuSigned by:
[Signature]
79D152626AC1406...
Approval