

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
FRIDAY APRIL 26, 2024**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a virtual meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:01 a.m. on April 26, 2024. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Liz Fishback, Bob Wilson, Kim Lucas, Bobby Palmosina and Sean Luther. Present from staff were David Onorato, Chris Holt, Christopher Speers, Jodi Hart, Jo-Ann Williams, Kathryn Van Why, Matt Jendrzewski, David Perry, Karla Howell, Bonnie Campbell, Denise Moschak, and Patricia Konesky. Also present were Nathan Clark of Buchanan, Ingersoll & Rooney, Amy Lewis and Nikki Walton of Maher Duessel and Allison Keating.

Ms. Fishback thanked the Board for being flexible with the rescheduling of today's meeting.

MINUTES

Ms. Fishback asked for approval of the minutes from the March 21, 2024, meeting.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Luther, the minutes were approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, present; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any public comments.

There were none.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that Authority's audit was completed and the close out meeting occurred with the audit committee represented by Board Members Ms. Fishback, Mr. Luther, Authority CEO Mrs. Hart, Ms. Lewis and Ms. Walton of Maher Duessel. Mr. Onorato advised that the Audit Committee accepted the audit as presented which had a clean opinion with no management letters. Mr. Onorato thanked Mrs. Howell and the entire finance department for their cooperation with the auditors allowing them to complete the audit on a timely basis. Mr. Onorato advised that both Ms. Lewis and Ms. Walton were present at today's meeting and asked if they would like to address the Board with any comments and also asked the Board if they had any questions for either representative.

Ms. Walton stated that there was a clean opinion issued on the financial statements and that there were no written management letters. She also stated that she would be happy to answer any questions.

Mr. Onorato thanked both Ms. Walton and Ms. Lewis, the finance department and all other departments who worked cooperatively to complete the audit on a timely basis.

Ms. Lewis thanked Mr. Onorato and the staff for working with them, pulling all of the paperwork together, and having good financials that can be audited.

Mr. Luther stated that from a Board perspective, this being his first experience on the audit committee, that an organization as complex as this to have another clean audit is really impressive and a testament to Mr. Onorato and the finance staff. He thanked them for keeping the Authority moving forward in the right direction.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on the closures of the Mon Wharf noting that there were no closures during March and 12 full closures in April. He advised that there were 20 full dates of closures this fiscal year so far.

Mr. Onorato advised that there will be extra reports discussed as this is a quarterly meeting and stated that he is aware that some of the Board members are pressed for time so will proceed as quickly as possible and answer any questions the Board may have on these reports.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Finance Report, stated that revenues from March were \$4.1 million which is a slight increase from March of 2023, but approximately \$900,000 less than the 2019 base year. He advised that the year-to-date revenues are \$12 million, slightly higher than March of 2023 and again lower than the \$14.2 million in March 2019. He advised that we are on target for our 2024 budget. Mr. Onorato advised that the additional finance reports reflect the same trend with revenues steadily increasing since 2020.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Garage Facilities Report, which he states shows garage revenue being \$700,000 higher than last year. He advised that in 2023 there was one extra business day in the month of March which factors into why the numbers are slightly higher. He advised that the year-to-date garage revenue report which shows 2024 revenues at \$6.7 million compared to \$6.4 million in 2023.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Monthly Violation Report, showing a total of 15,706 tickets issued in March 2024 compared to 21,000 tickets in March 2023. He advised that the decline is attributable to having less enforcement officers on staff. He advised that the officer that are on-staff are doing a good job in keeping compliance up.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Street and Lot Revenue Report, which shows 2024 revenues at \$1.6 million, down approximately \$300,000 from \$1.9 million in 2019 and advised that revenues are trending in the right direction.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Quarterly Report which shows revenues in 2024 of \$2.2 million compared to \$2.4 million in revenues in 2019 slightly down from last year's March total. He advised that the payment to the city in the first quarter was \$1.5 million, which is payment of all net fines minus expenses.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Garage Utilization Report which shows the utilization on a daily basis at all of our facilities, which shows we are averaging about 70 % utilization whereas pre-covid utilization was approximately 98 % at capacity.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Garage Day and Evening Transactions report which show that in January and February of 2024 transactions were ahead of 2023 but that March 2024's transactions are lower than 2023, which he stated could be due to having one extra day this month.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Downtown Housing Report which shows that in the start of 2024 there were 458 leases which has increased by 26 leases to a total of 484 Downtown Housing Lease of which Smithfield/Liberty, Mellon Square, Grant Street Transportation Center and First Avenue accounts for 76 % of these Downtown Housing Leases.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Quarterly Meter Revenue Report which shows revenues by street and lot locations. He noted that the report shows the method of payment for the total transactions and noted that over the first quarter 1.44 % was paid using coins, 32 % were paid using credit card at the meter and 66 % were paid by credit card via a phone app. He stated that credit cards are used in 98 % of the total transactions.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Revenue Per Space Report, which shows 2024 total of \$6.7 million and 2023 \$6.4 million. He advised that the revenues per space increased approximately \$30 in total, last year there were \$749 average per space and in 2024 its \$779 per space with Smithfield/Liberty, Mellon Square and Oliver being the top three per space revenue garages.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Pay-by-Phone Report which shows that ParkMobile still holds a large lead over the other three vendors due to them having a 6-year head start. He advised that ParkMobile controls approximately 90 % of the revenues coming in from the phone apps with over 800,000 transactions, which represents 96 % of the transactions. He advised that Pay-By-Phone, Meter Feeder each had approximately 15,000 transactions and Flowbird had about 1,900 transactions.

Mr. Luther asked if the Parking Authority was sharing the Downtown Housing Lease Report with the Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership.

Mr. Speers responded that we give the PDP the Utilization percentage report on a monthly basis.

Mr. Luther stated that as a former downtown resident he is interested in this information and advised that this is a great stat for us to be keeping track of.

Mr. Speers advised that the number was tracking downward last year, and this was partially due to the Ft. Duquesne and Sixth losing parking due to the Roosevelt Building fire but noted that those parkers did start to return once the renovations were completed.

RESOLUTION NO. 14 OF APRIL 2024, “A RESOLUTION ACKNOWLEDGING MRS. DEBRA MEYER UPON HER RETIREMENT, was read by Mr. Luther and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato thanked Ms. Meyer for her service. He stated that with her beginning in the meter services department she gained the knowledge and knows the function of the department inside out and she is surely going to be missed. He stated that she was great at dealing with customers and her customer service skills were great.

Ms. Fishback thanked Mrs. Meyer on behalf of the Board for her years of service.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any additional questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, Resolution No. 14 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 15 OF APRIL 2024, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO AN INTERGOVERNMENTAL LEASE AGREEMENT WITH THE CITY OF PITTSBURGH”, was read by Mr. Wilson and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this resolution refers to the Forbes/Shady Lot which the Authority has been operating since 1973 when we entered into a lease agreement with the city for the operation of this lot. He stated that the original lease had expired and was never renewed, and in the lease, there are parameters as to who is responsible for the sidewalk cleanup. Mr. Onorato advised that the city has just recently replaced all of the sidewalks on the Murry Avenue side and since they replaced them the only change in the agreement is that we will be responsible for maintaining these sidewalks, which is an additional 75 to 100 feet. He advised that the Parking Authority receives all revenues from the lot and pays the City the normal parking tax.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Luther, Resolution No. 15 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 16 OF APRIL 2024, “A RESOLUTION RATIFYING AN EMERGENCY PROCUREMENT FOR CONTRACTING SERVICES NEEDED TO REPLACE EXISTING ELEVATOR EQUIPMENT AT THE MELLON SQUARE PARKING GARAGE, was read by Ms. Lucas and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the recent storms shorted out the panel box at the Mellon Square Garage, which disconnected the sump pump which are related to the elevator shaft, and at the same time there was a heavy rainstorm which caused flooding the elevator shafts because the pumps were not working, causing significant damage to the elevator cables. He stated that with this being a below ground garage the elevators transport people from the lower level up to the lobby. He advised that there is one elevator located in an area separate from these two which is still running but it's not able to handle the daily volume. He advised that we contracted with Otis Elevator, who is our current elevator contractor to have this emergency repair completed at a total cost not-to-exceed \$93,518.00. He advised that we are in the process of checking to see if this repair would be covered by insurance and depending on our deductible if it would be worthwhile submitting it.

Mr. Holt advised that there is a \$100,000 deductible on the Authority's policy.

Ms. Lucas asked if this is something that occurred recently as she remembered this discussion recently.

Mr. Onorato advised that recently there was an electrical shortage that rendered the elevators out of service and caused water to enter the elevator pits. He also noted that there was an existing freight elevator in the garage, not located by the two customer elevators, and the Authority updated this elevator to accommodate passengers, and fortunately this has been completed and this elevator can be used to transport patrons until both passenger elevators can be repaired.

Ms. Lucas asked if there needed to be any additional work completed, not just the emergency repair.

Mr. Holt advised that the cables and electrical apparatus were going to be addressed and we are going to add some monitors to the cabs which will indicate any invasion of water.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Wilson, Resolution No. 11 of 2024 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 17 OF APRIL 2024, “A RESOLUTION RATIFYING AN EMERGENCY PROCUREMENT FOR CONTRACTING SERVICES NEEDED TO REPLACE AN EXISTING GAS SERVICE LINE AT THE THIRD AVENUE PARKING GARAGE, was read by Mr. Luther and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato thanked the staff for recognizing the odor of gas throughout the garage and immediately notifying the gas company. He stated that the gas company identified a crack in one of the pipes and shut off the gas due to safety concerns. He stated that we reached out first to our plumbers but the repairs included some welding and they do not have welders on-staff so they recommend Huckenstein, who completed our boiler replacement at the Ft. Duquesne and Sixth Garage, who in turn recommended Manion Plumbing. The Authority reached out to Manion Plumbing who were able to complete the emergency repairs at a cost of \$24,500.00.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Ms. Fishback, Resolution No. 17 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

Mr. Onorato advised that Resolution No. 18, which is a change order for \$45.00, does not need Board action and therefore he is recommending that it be pulled and removed from the agenda.

OLD BUSINESS

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any old business matters to discuss.

Ms. Fishback thanked everyone for coming together to reschedule today's meeting. She also thanked the staff for a great job on the audit performance.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any additional old business matters to discuss.

There were none.

NEW BUSINESS

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any new business matters to discuss.

Mr. Onorato reminded the Board that we will be reaching out to them to schedule an Executive Session and stated he would appreciate a quick response.

Mr. Luther asked if the meeting in May would remain a virtual meeting.

Ms. Fishback confirmed that the next meeting will be held virtually and said this will be revisited after one of the Board member's retirement later this summer.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any additional new business matters to discuss.

There were none.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:36 a.m. with all the Board expressing their approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT

DocuSigned by:

Elizabeth Fishback

1970ED52F74E42D...

Chairman

ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF MINUTES

DocuSigned by:

TB - A

79D157626AC1486...

Approval