

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
THURSDAY, MAY 16, 2019**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a regular meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:21 a.m. on May 16, 2019 at 232 Boulevard of the Allies, Pittsburgh, PA 15222-1616. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Jeff Cohen, Aradhna Oliphant and Cathy Qureshi. Present from staff were: David Onorato, Christopher Speers, Chris Holt, Gwendolyn Bolden, Jo-Ann Williams, Philip Savino, Janet Staab, Tracy Sowinski, Kathryn Van Why, Bob Wilson, Debra Meyer, Donna Ritter, Anita Koch, Harry Wormsley and Pat Konesky. Also present was Jason Wrona of Buchanan Ingersoll; Dan Kiefer of Massaro; Chris Snellgrove of Flowbird and Alicia Carberry of the City of Pittsburgh Mayor's Office.

Mr. Cohen advised that the board held an Executive Session prior to the meeting to discuss real estate matters.

MINUTES

Mr. Cohen asked for approval of the minutes from the April 18, 2019 meeting.

Upon motion by Ms. Qureshi and seconded by Ms. Oliphant, the minutes were approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any public comments.

There were none.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that, per the easement agreement with Duquesne Light, for the addition of eight EV dual-unit chargers to be divided between the Third Avenue and Smithfield/Liberty facilities, that will bring the total number of spaces set aside for EV charging to 35. He advised that the Authority, Mr. Speers, in particular, was able to secure some additional grant monies for these chargers and asked Mr. Speers to update the Board on the matter.

Mr. Speers advised that an easement agreement with Duquesne Light was executed in February of this year, permitting Duquesne Light to attach communication devices on the Third Avenue and Smithfield Liberty Garages so they could read their meters automatically. He said that in return, the company agreed to donate to the Authority eight dual-electric vehicle chargers and also committed to fund up to \$40,000 per garage toward the costs of installation, signage and stall preparation. Mr. Speers explained that the agreement would not cover items such as networking costs which would be borne by the Authority, together any service and maintenance expenses. He advised that the total project cost was \$135,648, which includes Duquesne Light's \$58,00 purchase price and all remaining expenses, including those covering the networking and service agreements. He said that since the property involved is government-owned, we were able to apply to Driving PA Forward through the Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection we could receive up to \$5,000 per plug rebate. Mr. Speers advised that our application resulted in an award of \$77,544.00 in rebates, which covers all of the costs that would have been the Authority's responsibility to pay. He advised that the grant saved the Authority \$37,640 and Duquesne Light just under \$40,000, which means that the only project component not funded by the grant is the equipment procured directly by Duquesne Light.

Ms. Oliphant asked the current usage level of EV chargers at Authority facilities.

Mr. Speers advised we have 15 spaces at the First Avenue garage and four spaces at Grant Street, all of which are used at 90-to-95 percent of capacity in daily usage.

Ms. Oliphant asked if any private garages have EV chargers in their facilities.

Mr. Speers advised the private garages do, adding those owned by the SEA are equipped with them as well. He said SEA's Convention Center Garage has two Eaton units and the new Gold One Garage located on the North Shore has four, including some EV fast chargers. He stated however that the Parking Authority is the dominate provider of garage-housed EV chargers within the city.

Ms. Oliphant congratulated Mr. Speers and the Authority for their efforts in obtaining this grant and saving the Authority significant money.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on the City Data Share Project of the Western Pennsylvania Regional Data Center, which is managed through the University of Pittsburgh in partnership with Allegheny County and the City of Pittsburgh. He advised that we have been providing statistical data obtained through the meters' utilization and are very close to launching a program to allow the public to review our projected utilization rates for neighborhood lots and on-street metered spaces.

Mr. Onorato reported to the Board that the Authority recently installed five touch-screen meters as a pilot program to gauge reaction to that technology, three downtown and two on the North Shore. He said that all five have color monitors and do not accept quarters as payment or provide paper receipts. Mr. Onorato said that they have been in place for one week and to date, there have been approximately 1,000 transactions through those meters with 235 texts sent as proof of

payment. He advised that we will continue to monitor the meters activity to see how the public responds, noting that no complaints have been received as yet. He also advised that, as a test, 20 additional meters located in the downtown area have been modified to no longer accept quarters as payment.

Ms. Qureshi asked how many meters downtown accept quarters.

Mr. Onorato replied that there are still approximately 90 meters located downtown that accept quarters as payment.

Mr. Cohen said his concern is that if a patron intends to pay solely with coins only and the meter doesn't accept coins, it presents a problem for that patron.

Mr. Onorato advised that those patrons can pay at any other meter in the same zone and said that we intentionally did not place all the test meters within one location for that reason.

Ms. Qureshi asked if it would be possible to place a message on the screen of the test meters to inform the patrons that nearby meters accept coins as payment.

Mr. Onorato advised that her suggestion can certainly be explored.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board that the rates in the Cedarville Lot have been changed to \$1.00 per hour for the first three hours, then \$3.00 for each hour following those initial three. He advised that we have been working with the community groups and City Council to make changes in that lot to discourage all-day parking by hospital employees. He advised that the lot is consistently full by 8:00 a.m. each weekday and that since the change was implemented, there have been approximately 300 transactions that have exceeded 10-hour parking stays. He stated that we will monitor this lot's usage trend and make additional adjustments to encourage all-day parkers to use the garages instead.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the Authority issued an RFP for both the Bond Counsel and Bond Underwriter for the Ninth & Penn Project and said that once the bids are received, we will bring the contract resolution to the Board for its consideration and action. Mr. Onorato discussed the Finance Report, noting that it which he stated shows the same on-target data through April contained in Garage Facilities and Meter Reports. He stated that there are some expense line items that have increased from last year that we will continue to monitor.

Ms. Qureshi noted that salaries are down and asked if that was due to unfilled positions.

Mr. Onorato confirmed that unfilled positions were a factor, noting that we do have some interviews scheduled and hope to be filling those vacancies in the near future.

Ms. Qureshi asked if the Authority is responsible to submit payroll taxes to the City.

Ms. Williams advised that the Authority is exempt from the City payroll tax but said that we do pay FICA and SUTA obligations.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Facilities Report, noting the expected large decrease in Ninth & Penn results. He said we are still monitoring the trend of Shadyside Garage receipts.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Meter Report, noting that ticket issuance is up and compliance is holding steady. He said meter overstays, residential permit and street-cleaning ticketing represented 85 percent of the month's violations issued this month, adding that street cleaning enforcement began earlier this year. Mr. Onorato reported that last year, at the City's request, we issued warning tickets for the first month of street cleaning enforcement. He explained that because not every area gets swept in the first week it takes about a month to a month and a half to get through the full rotation of grace periods city-wide.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report, stating that the increase is due to the higher number of tickets issued as well as an increase in the number of booted vehicles.

Ms. Qureshi asked if there was an increase in ticket fines or if the increase in revenues was due solely to collections.

Mr. Onorato responded that the increase is due to the amount of tickets issued as well as the collection rate. He noted that we do have a few more officers this year and also are operating more efficiently, largely because of the increased use of LPR technology that permits our vehicles to move more quickly through their coverage areas.

Ms. Bolden added that the Authority still has open positions for part-time officers but said that four officers have been hired in the short amount of time that she has been on staff.

Mr. Cohen asked for an explanation of the Residential Permit Parking program, specifically if when the signage states one hour, a vehicle without a permit was allowed to park within that area for a one-hour period.

Mr. Onorato confirmed that any vehicle not displaying a permit is permitted to park in the area only for the length of time determined for the district and posted on the signage stipulating parking limits. He said choices of one-hour or two-hour RPP designations were determined by the residents of an area at the time it was enrolled in the program.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional questions.

There were none.

RESOLUTION NO. 17 OF MAY 2019, "A RESOLUTION ACKNOWLEDGING MS. SUE LIPINSKI FOR HER 19 YEARS OF PROFESSIONAL AND EXEMPLARY SERVICE IN HER EMPLOYMENT AT THE PITTSBURGH PARKING AUTHORITY, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato introduced Ms. Lipinski and thanked her for her years of service, stating that she has been very dedicated to her job regardless of position, either as an enforcement officer or later as a meter repair technician. He said that Ms. Lipinski made working with her a pleasure and that the Authority staff and he personally will miss her. Mr. Onorato wished her well in her future endeavors and presented Ms. Lipinski with a retirement gift.

Mr. Cohen congratulated Ms. Lipinski for her years of service.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Qureshi and seconded by Ms. Oliphant, Resolution No. 17 of 2019 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 18 OF MAY 2019, "A RESOLUTION OF THE PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE AUTHORITY TO AWARD A CONTRACT TO DORE & ASSOCIATES CONTRACTING FOR THE DEMOLITION OF THE NINTH AND PENN PARKING GARAGE, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority received nine bids for the demolition of the Ninth and Penn Garage and said Dore submitted the lowest price of \$634,400, of which \$179,380 will be committed to MBE participation. He advised that the firm's references were checked in detail and came back positive. He reported that the Pittsburgh Cultural Trust issued a separate RFP for the demolition of its Duff's building and said there is a possibility that Dore will be the contractor chosen to perform that project also. Mr. Onorato introduced Mr. Kiefer of Massaro Corporation, the Authority's Contract Manager for this project who stated that its vetting of Dore & Associates also produced positive responses. He also noted that four of the companies listed on the bid tab sheets are not themselves demolition companies but actually are subcontractors who attended the pre-bid meeting in hope of working with the chosen demolition company.

Ms. Oliphant asked for an explanation of the column on the bid tab sheet labeled addendum acknowledgement.

Mr. Onorato advised that the column's contents verifies that the bidding vendor received and acknowledged receipt of any addendums issued related to this RFP.

Ms. Qureshi stated that Dore's bid is significantly lower than the others other submitted and asked if the Authority was satisfied that it understood the scope of work and was committed to not having any change orders.

Mr. Onorato stated that the Authority and Massaro held a meeting with Dore representatives and discussed the scope of work, including keeping change orders to zero if possible. He noted that there is always a chance of unforeseen issues that may result in a change order, but said we will monitor that closely.

Ms. Oliphant asked what procedures will be taken for environmental mediation.

Mr. Kiefer responded that part of the scope of demolition work will require uses of water techniques to keep dust at a minimum and said that the construction fencing will contain a screening line to keep any dust generated within the footprint of the garage.

Mr. Onorato stated that Massaro representatives have already met with surrounding businesses and institutions such as CAPA to keep them informed of the project and discuss their concerns.

Ms. Qureshi asked the timeline of the project.

Mr. Onorato responded that the garage will be closed at the end of this month and we hope that the demolition company will be onsite early in June. He advised that there could be a potential delay if the County requires the Authority to obtain a separate permit because they view our project and the Cultural Trust's project as one operation. He said that interpretation would increase the square footage to over an acre and would therefore require an additional permit. He noted that if we are required to obtain this second permit it would delay the project for approximately one month. He advised that the demolition contract timeline will be six months once they are given the notice to proceed.

Mr. Cohen noted that his concern with some of these contractors is that they are not using local labor and local companies to perform their scopes of work.

Mr. Kiefer responded that Mike Green is the local Dore representative who has an office here in Pittsburgh and will be responsible for working with the local operator's union for labor.

Mr. Onorato added that we did check with the local union and stated that it did not have any issues with Dore and Associates being awarded this project.

Mr. Cohen asked if we had options to not award to the lowest bidder.

Mr. Onorato responded that the procurement process was for a low-bid contract. He said that the Authority could reject all bids received and then rebid the project.

Mr. Wrona asked Mr. Cohen if there was something that he was seeing that made him feel that we need to reject all bids and rebid.

Mr. Cohen stated that there was nothing that he saw was concerning but just wanted to make sure that since Dore was the lowest bidder and found to be responsible, if the process would permit the Authority to just move onto the second lowest bidder for any reason.

Mr. Onorato added that Dore was the demolition company used to bring down the Greyhound terminal but said that Mr. Green was not involved on that project.

Mr. Wrona confirmed that if Dore was the lowest bidder and was deemed responsible it should be awarded to contract. He said, however, should contract negotiations break down and no contract is finalized, the Authority can move onto the second lowest bid.

Mr. Qureshi asked if the Authority had any knowledge of past projects that Dore completed.

Mr. Kiefer advised that Dore did supply references, and that Massaaro, on behalf of the Authority, did confirm that the jobs that Mr. Green specifically oversaw received glowing reports for the most part. He advised that Dore has its own hazmat abatement team in house.

Mr. Wrona added that the City's best practices and green requirements for construction were incorporated into the RFP and will also be included in the Gore contract.

Ms. Qureshi noted that average of all the bids, excluding the high and low bid, were within a more concentrated price grouping.

Mr. Onorato responded that this would not be true of the Cultural Trust's bids for the demolition of its building, where the second lowest bid was more than double the lowest one received.

Ms. Qureshi asked if our second low bidder bid on the Cultural Trust's project.

Mr. Onorato responded that we are not aware if they did or did not bid that work.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Ms. Qureshi, Resolution No. 18 of 2019 was tabled as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 19 OF MAY 2019, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ISSUE A REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL TO SOLICIT ARCHITECTURAL/ENGINEERING FIRMS TO BE RETAINED AS A CONSULTANT FOR PROFESSIONAL SERVICES ON AN AS-NEEDED BASIS, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that our current contract for this service expires at the end of August and we are seeking authorization to solicit bids for continuing the service. He advised that the current vendor is O&S who billed us approximately \$25,000 in 2016, \$40,000 in 2017 and \$4,000 to

date. He stated that because the Authority does not have an engineer on staff, we like to have this service available for any type of emergency or issue.

Mr. Cohen asked if the service was paid for on an hourly basis.

Mr. Holt responded that this contract is on an as-needed basis, with the provider being called out as needed and paid an hourly rate for the work performed.

Ms. Qureshi asked if this was the contract we authorize to ensure the life safety and soundness of the garages.

Mr. Onorato responded that this is different function, noting that what she is referring to is the annual garage inspection program. He said the current contract with the provider of that service will remain in effect for one additional year.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Ms. Qureshi, Resolution No. 19 of 2019 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 20 OF MAY 2019, "A RESOLUTION OF THE PITTSBURGH PARKING AUTHORITY AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO NEGOTIATE AND ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT FOR LAND EXCHANGE WITH THE PITTSBURGH TRUST FOR CULTURAL RESOURCES AND A DEMOLITION COOPERATION AND TEMPORARY CONSTRUCTION EASEMENT AGREEMENT WITH THE TRUST, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this resolution is related to the Ninth & Penn project where the block face between Ft. Duquesne, Penn and Eighth and Ninth Street, with the exception of our garage, is owned by the Pittsburgh Cultural Trust. He noted that the Trust will be demolishing the Duff's building at about the same time as we will be razing our garage and said we would like to reach an easement agreement with them permitting us to utilize their surface lot for construction vehicles and the mobilization of our demo company. He stated that the land exchange would result in our moving the existing footprint back off Penn Avenue about 20 feet into their property and a little further west onto Eighth Street. He stated that with this exchange the footprint will be a little more to the center of the block face, leaving the outside perimeters as sites for retail or storefront use.

Ms. Qureshi stated that she is in support of this but inquired if the property owned by the Cultural Trust requires the payment of taxes to the City of Pittsburgh,

Mr. Wrona stated that if the property is currently used for private surface parking they would pay real estate and parking tax. He said because their theaters are for a cultural use, they are considered non-profit.

Ms. Oliphant asked if the Authority is happy with the swap, if it is fairly equitable and in the service of our mission.

Mr. Onorato replied that we are and it is, noting that the net gain on either side will be minimal. He stated there will be an entrance and exit off of Eighth Avenue that will cross over onto the Cultural Trust's property and said we have been working well together thus far to get this project to underway.

Mr. Wrona stated that it is important to note that the Cultural Trust is giving the Authority temporary easements on their surface parking lots without cost to the Authority. He said the will cause it to give up significant revenues from parked vehicles for an approximately two-year period.

Mr. Onorato added that the Trust is also permitting the Authority to use its land to house the construction trailer, additionally saving the Authority a large amount of cost.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Ms. Qureshi, Resolution No. 20 of 2019 was tabled as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

OLD/NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any new or old business questions to discuss.

Mr. Onorato mentioned that if the Board would like to examine and become acquainted with the function of touchscreen meters or one of the color units, he said both models are located outside of our office for that purpose.

Mr. Cohen asked if there was any additional new or old business matters to discuss.

There were none.

The next Board meeting is scheduled for Thursday June 20, 2019 at 10:00 a.m.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:55 am with all Board Members in approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT



Chairman

**ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF
MINUTES**



Approval