

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
THURSDAY, AUGUST 16, 2018**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a regular meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:18 a.m. on August 16, 2018, at 232 Boulevard of the Allies, Pittsburgh, PA 15222-1616. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Jeff Cohen, Cathy Qureshi, Aradhna Olipant and Erika Strassburger. Present from staff were: David Onorato, Chris Holt, Christopher Speers, Jo-Ann Williams, John Fournier, Janet Staab, James Smith, Bob Wilson, Tracy Sowinski, Patrick Osuch, Kathryn Van Why, Jason Phillips and Pat Konesky. Also present were Jason Wrona of Buchanan Ingersoll; Alicia Carberry of the City of Pittsburgh Mayor's Office, Alison Keating a city resident and William Stewart of Strategic Communications.

Mr. Cohen advised that the Board held an Executive Session directly preceding the meeting to discuss real estate and personnel matters.

MINUTES

Mr. Cohen asked for approval of the minutes from the June 28, 2018 meeting.

Upon motion by Ms. Qureshi and seconded by Ms. Oliphant, the minutes were approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Ms. Strassburger, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. Keating introduced herself as a city resident who felt compelled to address the Board regarding the Ninth and Penn redevelopment project. She stated that she had the understanding that this project would include artist studios or affordable housing options. She stated that it appears that the Pittsburgh Cultural Trust has taken the lead on the project and she stated that she has heard rumors that one of its Board members sees this project as their capstone achievement. She said she wanted to share her concern that this being a publicly owned property that there should include a certain amount of low-income or affordable housing, and not be devoted to just residents seeking luxury spaces.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any public comments.

There were none.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato stated that the Authority is still pursuing ticketing by mail and hopes that authorizing legislation will be presented in the next month or two. He said the action will give the Authority the ability to issue tickets through the mail in addition to placing them on vehicle windshields.

Ms. Qureshi asked if it would be possible for someone to get a ticket and not be aware of it until they receive the notice in the mail.

Mr. Onorato confirmed that could be the case.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on the lighting upgrade project and advised that it is almost 50-percent complete. He said four garages are completed presently and noted that an additional five are scheduled for completion by the end of the year.

Mr. Onorato advised that Authority's sources of City-eligible funding through July project that the City will be receiving \$28.8 million for the full year.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Finance Report, noting that at seven months into our fiscal year, revenue is on pace to be about six percent above budget while and the year-to-date revenue for the same period in 2017 is even. He advised that expenses are under budget by about three percent. He advised that the cash flow report shows a similar trend of five percent above budget, noting that we are also performing on that pace on a straight-line or cash-flow basis.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Facilities Report, advising that its revenue numbers tie into the Finance Report and said we are continuing to increase revenues at a rate of eight percent from last year. He noted that the year-to-date report shows a large decrease in revenues at the Mon Wharf, which is directly related to 37 full and three partial days of closure due to flooding. He advised that we are just under one percent below target, again as indicated in the Finance Report.

Mr. Cohen stated that the reports show that the revenues at Mellon Square are beginning to increase.

Mr. Speers added that the effect of the capacity increase near the Mellon Square and Oliver Garages has already leveled out and advised that the new capacity did not affect Smithfield/Liberty. He advised that he believes utilization will improve additionally when the construction's condo component is completed.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement Report, noting that tickets issued during the month increased slightly from last year, noting that 44 percent of tickets issued are for meter violations.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Meter Revenue Report, stating that the positive trend begun when the new meters were installed is continuing. He said that total revenues are up 3.8 percent.

Mr. Cohen stated that it makes sense that the number of tickets has decreased because of the public's increased use of the pay-by-phone application.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report, stating that it shows an increase from the same time last year.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

RESOLUTION NO. 34 OF AUGUST 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO AWARD A CONTRACT FOR THE REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT OF AN EXISTING SUMP PUMP AT THIRD AVENUE PARKING GARAGE, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this is the facility's original sump pump and is in need of replacement. He advised that the Authority received four bids for the project.

Mr. Qureshi stated that because the Board is always quick to point out when there is a wide disparity in bid prices, she wanted to note that this appears to be a good bid process with multiple bids in strong relation to each other. She noted the presence of a certified WBE as another positive.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Qureshi and seconded by Ms. Oliphant, Resolution No. 34 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Ms. Strassburger, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 35 OF AUGUST 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE A CHANGE ORDER TO CARL WALKER CONSTRUCTION, INCORPORATED FOR THE REPAIR AND PREVENTIVE MAINTENANCE OF THE SHILOH PARKING PLAZA was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Shiloh Parking Plaza is currently closed and while undergoing renovation, the deterioration of beams and columns within the decks was found to be deeper than anticipated. He said we are asking for approval to proceed with an additional scope of work while the contractor and equipment are still mobilized at the site. He noted that, even with this change order, the project cost is still approximately \$17,000 below the second lowest bidder of the three bids received when the contract was awarded in May.

Mr. Holt added that the change order will have an impact on the completion schedule and said that Authority representatives alerted the City Council district office, as well as area constituents and business owners to the anticipated delay.

Ms. Qureshi asked how far along the project was and if we anticipate any additional change orders.

Mr. Holt responded that the project was on schedule to be completed on September 1 but will be delayed due to this change. He said we do not anticipate any additional change orders.

Ms. Qureshi stated that this is a rather large change order and it would be interesting to see a list of Authority change order payments and the vendors involved over the past five to 10 years.

Ms. Oliphant added that this is public safety issue that should be addressed as soon as possible and asked if there was any type of process available that would prevent this type of problem from occurring in the future.

Mr. Onorato advised that when the Authority enters into contracts we stress to vendors that they fully understand the scope of work and expect that no change orders will be necessary. He said that some conditions such as this one can be unforeseen, adding that while the Authority does not track change orders in the manner suggested by Ms. Oliphant, he doesn't believe there are any vendors that continually submit change orders on their projects.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Qureshi and seconded by Ms. Oliphant, Resolution No. 35 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Ms. Strassburger, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 36 OF AUGUST 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE FINAL PAYMENT TO NATHAN CONTRACTING, LP FOR REPAIR AND PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE OF THE ELEVATOR SHAFT AT MELLON SQUARE PARKING GARAGE, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this work on the elevator shaft has been completed by Nathan Contracting to the satisfaction of the Authority, explaining that with all punch list items now completed, we are asking to release final payment in the amount of \$19,688.80. He advised that the original contract was \$96,888.00 and said there were no change orders to this contract. He stated that the MBE participation on this project was seven percent.

Ms. Qureshi stated that she recalled that there would be a deduction on this contract when it was completed.

Mr. Holt responded that there was no credit due on this project but said that one did occur on another project.

Ms. Qureshi stated that there is a deduction shown on the pay app and asked what it

pertained to.

Mr. Holt advised that this credit was for a surplus of materials that were not used, noting that at the beginning of the project it was believed that there was water penetration and damage that was found to not be the case once the project got underway.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Ms. Strassburger, Resolution No. 36 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Ms. Strassburger, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 37 OF AUGUST 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO A LICENSE AGREEMENT WITH BOMBARDIER FOR PARKING AT THE GRANT STREET TRANSPORTATION CENTER, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the passage of a bill in 2017 authorized the Parking Authority to work with developers and companies coming into the downtown area. He reported that this case met all of the bill's parameters for cooperation, with a less-than-90-percent occupancy rate and sufficient additional available spaces. He advised that we are requesting to enter into an agreement with Bombardier for 200 leased spaces for a period of four years. He advised that 150 leases will be guaranteed for two years whether they are used or not at a discounted rate and after the first two years the rate will be discounted rate of \$175.00 with the rate increasing \$25.00 every year until the fourth year when the lease will be at market rate. He stated that the action will enable the Authority to assist a new company relocating into the old Seagate Building by providing leases in a garage that is currently underutilized and has spaces available.

Ms. Qureshi asked the type of firm Bombardier was.

Ms. Oliphant responded that it is an international Engineering firm and asked the current utilization rate was at the Grant Street Transportation Center.

Mr. Onorato responded that the current utilization rate is 67 percent, with a daily average of approximately 300 spaces remaining available on a daily average.

Ms. Qureshi asked if this agreement will be presented to the Board again in two years or would continue automatically.

Mr. Onorato responded that the contract will be in place for four years and after that the rates will be at market level, so there will be no need to come back to the Board. He noted that the guarantee of payment for 150 leases will be for the first two years only. He said that, in years three and four, they will pay only for the spaces actually being used.

Ms. Qureshi asked if the Authority was guaranteeing the 200 spaces after the first two years.

Mr. Onorato stated that we would most likely have those spaces available.

Ms. Oliphant asked how many spaces are available to the public on a daily basis at Grant Street Transportation Center, minus the existing leases.

Mr. Speers responded that the 67-percent usage equaled to about 650 spaces of the facility's 990-space total.

Ms. Strassburger stated that she thought it might be appropriate to bring back to the Board if the public parking percentage rate changed substantially.

Mr. Onorato stated that the Board sets the market rate and if this firm remains in the garage after its four-year lease expires, it would be at market rate.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Qureshi and seconded by Ms. Straussburger, Resolution No. 37 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Ms. Strassburger, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

OLD/NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Cohen asked if there was any new or old business for discussion.

Mr. Onorato advised that we will be reaching out to the Board for possible dates for the reschedule of both the September and October 2018 Board Meetings.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that Mr. Fournier, current Director of On-Street and Metered Parking, will be leaving the Authority to assume a position in city government for the City of Ann Arbor, Michigan, his home town. He thanked Mr. Fournier for the work that he has done here at the Authority and wished him well in his new position.

Mr. Cohen thanked Mr. Fournier for his services, noting that his departure will be a huge loss for the Authority.

Ms. Oliphant stated that he will be missed and said it always a great loss when young talent leaves the region.

There were none.

The next Board meeting is scheduled for Thursday September 20, 2018 at 10:00 a.m.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:51 am with all Board Members in approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT



Chairman

**ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF
MINUTES**



Approval