

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
THURSDAY FEBRUARY 17, 2022**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a virtual meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:01 a.m. on February 17, 2022. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Jeff Cohen, Matt Barron, Liz Fishback and Bobby Wilson. Present from staff were David Onorato, Christopher Speers, Chris Holt, Jo-Ann Williams, Gwen Bolden, Mark DiNatale, David Perry, Tracy Sowinski, Karla Stanger, Jana Williams, Scott McNaugher and Patricia Konesky. Also present were Jason Wrona of Buchanan, Ingersoll & Rooney, Bill Stewart of Strategic Communications, Tim Jones of Massaro Construction; Alison Keating, Elena Zaitsoff, Jared Wright and an unidentified participant at 412-690-5556.

MINUTES

Mr. Cohen asked for approval of the minutes from the January 20, 2022 meeting.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Barron, the minutes were approved as follows: Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any public comments.

Ms. Zaitsoff addressed the Board advising that she has lived in RPP Area E, which is across the street from Magee Women's Hospital, for 42 years and stated that this area is 56-percent over-subscribed for permit parking. She stated that she would like to know about the new RPP ordinance and its planned timeline for implementation, noting that during the hearings for this new ordinance, all parties agreed that the successful implementation would require more enforcement. She asked that the change not be implemented until additional enforcement can be guaranteed. She said a search of our website contained a posting stating that standard practice is not just to ticket RPP violations but to enforce all parking violations encountered, including parking facing toward the flow of traffic; blocking or parking too closely to a crosswalk, driveway or intersection, stop sign or fire hydrant; handicap parking; and parking on a sidewalk. She stated that Area E parking continues to feature all of these occurrences and, even prior to the pandemic period, were not ticketed and are still not. She said in speaking with a Parking Enforcement Officer about parking the wrong way while pointing to an entire block of vehicles parked in that direction, she was told that enforcement could not occur unless the street contains a yellow line. She then asked if that comment was accurate and asked also about plans for the Forbes-Semple Garage. Ms. Zaitsoff noted that she is Vice-President of the Oakcliff Community

Corporation, adding that while she is not authorized to speak for that organization today but stated that her comments are largely in tune with the positions of her neighbors.

Mr. Cohen asked if she had called the Parking Authority to discuss her concerns,

Ms. Zaitsoff responded that she has spoken with Ms. Bolden at Oakwatch meetings, stating that enforcement in the area is normally very spotty. She said that after speaking with Ms. Bolden the function improves initially but usually returns to the lower levels of efficiency about a week later.

Mr. Cohen asked Mr. Onorato if someone could follow up after the meeting with Ms. Zaitsoff regarding her concerns and asked if she had an email address she could share.

Ms. Zaitsoff responded that she would put her email into the Zoom chat.

Mr. Cohen also asked if her comment regarding not being able to issue a ticket for wrong-way parking unless there was a yellow line was correct.

Mr. Onorato responded that he does not believe this requirement is stated in the ordinance but said that he would research the document to confirm its presence.

Mr. Cohen asked Ms. Zaitsoff her concerns on the Forbes-Semple Garage.

Ms. Zaitsoff replied that some of the draft proposals she viewed at neighborhood meetings calls for the garage to be torn down. She said that action would eliminate a highly used parking garage, stating that removing any Oakland parking creates an additional burden on the residential parking areas in the Oakland neighborhoods. She stated that parking has already been reduced by taking parking lanes out of service to permit more outdoor seating for area cafes.

Mr. Onorato advised that at this time there is no plans to demolish the Forbes-Semple Garage. He stated that he also heard comments to that effect but stated that the Parking Authority was not involved in any of those discussions. He repeated that there are no plans to tear down that Authority garage.

Mr. Speers added that the Authority is actually proceeding with a major rehabilitation project at the site, noting that the process actually will begin today with a resolution authorizing the selection of an engineer to develop scope of work that will result in extending the useful life of the Forbes/Semple garage.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional public comments.

There were none.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on the ongoing Audit and said we expect the auditors

to be on-site next week and hope to finalize their work and present it for approval at the April meeting.

Mr. Onorato advised that during January 2022 the Mon Wharf was closed for three days due to flooding and said that so far in February it has already been closed for five full days. He added that the river is expected to crest at 22 feet today and, with flooding occurring at 18 feet, he advised that we will be required to take the necessary steps to shut the Wharf down again.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the 2021 payment of \$15.2 million to the City was transferred today. He said the amount is based on the revised Co-Op and Parking Court agreements now in effect.

Ms. Fishback asked the amount forwarded to the city in 2021 for the 2020 calendar year.

Mr. Onorato advised that the amount was also in the \$15 million range and said that he would research the exact amount and share it with the Board.

Ms. Williams advised that payment to the City last year was just shy of \$14.5 million, noting that this year's amendment of the Co-Op Agreement reduced our payments to the City by \$2.9 million.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the Authority will resume street cleaning enforcement beginning on April 1, 2022 after a two-year hiatus due to the pandemic. He reminded the members that this program runs from April through November each year and advised that the Authority will notify the affected communities, Pittsburgh's City Council and the media while also adding this information to our website. Mr. Onorato asked Mr. Wilson to assist in getting the information on the resumption of enforcement circulated through City Council's district information programs.

Mr. Cohen suggested that once street cleaning enforcement resumes after not having occurred in awhile, the process could begin with warning tickets.

Ms. Fishback and Mr. Barron stated that they agreed with Mr. Cohen's suggestion.

Mr. Wilson stated that the residents of the areas that receive street cleaning are asking when the service would resume.

Ms. Fishback asked the most efficient way for us to push out this notification.

Mr. Onorato stated that we will be reaching out to all City Council members to formally advise them of the start. He also asked that Mr. Wilson to suggest methods for spreading the word through existing Council's communication network.

Mr. Wilson stated that there is a website that reminds people of things like garbage pickup and suggested that as a resource. He stated that the subject can also be discussed at various

community group meetings and suggested that we inform all RPP permitholders by email as we have their addresses on file from their permit applications.

Ms. Fishback noted that Ms. Zaitsoff posted in the meeting chat that her organization and network could assist as well.

Mr. Cohen asked the ticket amount for a street cleaning violation.

Mr. Onorato advised that the fine for violation of street cleaning parking is \$30.00.

Mr. Barron asked if there was a way to send push notifications through the parking meter apps.

Mr. Onorato responded that we can check with our phone vendors on the possibility of doing a push using their respective apps.

Mr. Onorato advised that boot notices for the first quarter of 2022 have been sent out in an attempt to collect the outstanding debts, in that enforcement category. He advised that there are 2,800 notices that have been sent to advise the owners that their vehicles are boot-eligible and give them the opportunity to make payments on the outstanding tickets prior to their vehicles being booted and towed.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Finance Report, noting that 2019's revenues are again being shown as our base year. He advised that January's total revenues are \$2.6 million from facility receipts of \$1.6 million and meter revenues at \$948,000. He noted that both numbers are up from last year and are moving in the right direction but are still beneath 2019 totals. He advised that the Wood Allies Garage reached full capacity a few times recently and we were told that one of the larger employers in the downtown area has their employees scheduled to return to in-office settings beginning in the middle of March. He reminded the Board, for comparison purposes, the January revenues from both 2019 and 2020 were more than \$4 million, both months unaffected by the pandemic that didn't start until March 2020.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Facility Report, which shows that garage activity has increased from 2021 but said our utilization rate of approximately 50 percent system-wide shows we still have a long way to go. He advised that the Forbes-Semple Garage, located in Oakland as discussed earlier, is at approximately 90-percent utilization.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement Meter Report, noting that ticket issuance is up compared to last year with 47 percent of the violations being meter violation and 30 percent being residential permit parking violations.

Mr. Cohen noted that he still cannot understand why, with all the technology available to the public, there are still so many tickets being issued.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Meter Report, which shows meter revenue for January at \$948,000 for 2022 as compared to \$728,000 in 2021 and \$1.5 million in 2019. He noted that our projections also show an anticipated increase for February 2022. He advised that in 2019 the Authority had

453 lot leases system-wide, a number that dropped significantly during the pandemic. He said that the 2022 lease total, having fallen beginning in 2020, has risen to 338.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report, stating that revenues this year are at \$542,000 compared to \$459,000 last year. He noted that Parking Court revenues correlate directly to the number of tickets issued.

RESOLUTION NO. 7 OF FEBRUARY 2022, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE A CHANGE ORDER AND FINAL PAYMENT TO FIRE FIGHTER SALES & SERVICE CO. FOR THE UPGRADES TO THE FIRE PROTECTION SYSTEM AT THE WOOD ALLIES GARAGE, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that we are seeking authorization to release final payment in the amount of \$21,343.08 to Fire Fighters Sales and Service Company for the fire protection equipment installed in the Wood Allies Garage. He advised that the system was beyond its useful life, had become a safety issue and was easily apparent that it needed to be replaced. He advised that the total contract, after the credit of \$896.92 reflected in this change order, was \$131,503.08.

Mr. Cohen asked the anticipated life expectancy of the newly installed system.

Mr. Holt responded that the anticipated life expectancy of this new system is 10 to 15 years.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Mr. Wilson, Resolution No.7 of 2022 was approved as follows: Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 8 OF FEBRUARY 2022, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO AWARD A CONTRACT TO DESMAN DESIGN MANAGEMENT AS STRUCTURAL ENGINEERING CONSULTANT FOR THE REPAIRS AND PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE AT THE FORBES-SEMPLER GARAGE, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this first step of getting the engineering services in place is to address structural work needed to be done at the Forbes-Semple Garage. He advised that the Authority received four bids for the assignment and said we are recommending awarding Desman Design Management Company a contract in the amount of \$181,190.00 to provide engineering services

which would detail the scope of work required to complete the structural repairs of the entire facility, including full and partial deck repairs, steel erection where needed, curb replacement and steel placement, at a minimum. He advised that this is a professional services contract and not one awarded on a low-bid contract. He advised that the RFP used a 100-point scale in the bid evaluations to measure project understanding and implementation; fee proposal; value-added items, and MBE/WBE participation. Mr. Onorato advised that a committee was formed to evaluate the submissions. He thanked Mr. Jones of Massaro Corporation and Board Member Barron who served on the committee with staff members Mr. Holt; Mr. DiNatale and Mr. Wilson. Mr. Onorato advised that the need for this work was included in the Authority's annual garage inspection report. He advised that the anticipated schedule for contractor mobilization will be June or July of 2022.

Mr. Barron commented that this was a great process and said he was happy to participate. He advised that there was a very robust discussion among the committee and advised that that everyone felt that Desman's proposal was well above and beyond the others submitted.

Mr. Onorato also thanked Mr. Barron and Mr. Jones for their time and participation.

Mr. Wilson stated that he noticed that Desman was MBE/WBE certified and asked if that was an important factor in the decision.

Mr. Onorato responded that MBE/WBE certification was worth 10 points of our 100-point evaluation system.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 8 of 2022 was approved as follows: Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any new or old matters to discuss.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Clemente Bridge will be closed through the end of 2023 and advised that we will monitor the impact of the closure has on our Ft. Duquesne and Sixth Garage as that bridge is a primary connector to the North Side and is highly utilized during events on the North Shore. He noted that this is a complete bridge closure that bars both vehicles and pedestrians from its use.

Mr. Wilson asked the timeline for the Forbes-Semple Garage repairs.

Mr. Onorato advised that we anticipate awarding the contract tomorrow and, once all the documents are signed, our goal is to issue the RFP in time for the successful bidder to mobilize on the site in June or July for an anticipated 12-month construction period. He advised that the completed repairs should extend the useful life of the facility by 25 years.

Mr. Wilson noted that, there being only a certain amount of parking spaces in the garage during construction, we should give priority to leaseholders.

Mr. Onorato advised that leaseholders will be offered a priority and said we are anticipating a loss of 185 to 200 spaces during the work period. He noted that we will most likely lose some of the transient revenue during that time as we do not have another facility in the Oakland area to accommodate them. He advised that the thought process is that the more spaces you give the contractor to work in, the sooner the work can be completed. Mr. Onorato advised that the loss of revenue is accounted for in our 2022 budget.

Mr. Cohen stated that he was pleased that the Finance Team accounted for this adjustment in the 2022 budget as it is very important for the Authority to remain in a financially sound position.

Ms. Williams thanked Mr. Cohen and stated that Mr. Speers was responsible for attention to such garage-related budget accommodations of this nature.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional new business matters to discuss.

There were none.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:35 a.m. with all Board members in approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT

DocuSigned by:
Jeff Cohen

Chairman

ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF MINUTES

DocuSigned by:
Liz Fishback

Approval