

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE  
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH  
THURSDAY JANUARY 19, 2023**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a virtual meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 9:04 a.m. on January 19, 2023. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Jeff Cohen, Bobby Wilson and Liz Fishback. Present from staff were David Onorato, Christopher Speers, Chris Holt, Gwen Bolden, Mark DiNatale, David Perry, Scott McNaugher, Karla Turzak, Matt Engleson, Jana Williams, Anide Michel, Karla Stanger and Patricia Konesky. Also present were Jason Wrona of Buchanan, Ingersoll & Rooney, Bill Stewart of Strategic Communications, Mark McCall of Assured Partners and Alison Keating.

**MINUTES**

Mr. Cohen asked for approval of the minutes from the December 15, 2022 meeting.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Ms. Fishback the minutes were approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any public comments.

There were none.

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that he met with DCNR and Mosites regarding the Mon Wharf Connector Project, which will get underway in the next few weeks. He advised that its completion will connect the Mon Wharf to Point State Park.

Mr. Onorato shared recent correspondence with the Board from a customer praising the performance of two members of the at our Douglas/Phillips Lot. He stated that this outreach is highly appreciated because the public doesn't usually take the time to write to us with this kind of information.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on the Authority's Insurance Renewal, noting last month's Board approved of the 2023 insurance renewal with the exception of the cyber and property categories. He advised that since last month we have finalized both of those policies. He explained that between the two insurance coverages the estimated projected-to-actual premiums costs were reduced by \$12,000. Mr. Onorato advised that the cyber security coverage was marketed to 33 carriers, including the incumbent firms and reported that Cowbell/Scottsdale will now be supplying the cyber security coverage. Mr. Onorato advised that Mr. McCall was present as a Zoom meeting participant and was available to answer any questions the Board may have.

Mr. McCall stated that the overall increase in our insurance program of 12.1 percent should be seen as extremely favorable. He stated that the modification based on the past three years of experience, together with the worker's compensation claims, had increased 22 percent and said this added inflationary pressures that the carriers are putting on increasing limits on the property portion as well. He also noted that some coverage scans showed increased vulnerability and stated that the Authority is really stepping up on addressing those that have been identified. He advised that there was a third-party vulnerability scan of all of the Authority's computer systems and said a couple significant issues were found. He said the Authority's IT Director should be applauded for addressing them because they were part of the issue we had when we were marketing those insurances.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Finance Reports, noting that this is a year-end summary and advised that the Authority revenues for 2022 were \$41.8 million compared to a budgeted total of \$39.8 million. He described the results as a trend in the right direction, but still off approximately 16 million from 2019's revenue volume. He described that the two major line items for revenues continue to be from garage receipts and meter operations. He noted that garage receipts for 2022 were \$24.5 million compared to \$35.5 million in 2019 while the year's more than \$15 million in meter receipts compared to more than \$19 million in volume in 2019. He advised that meters are returning to pre-pandemic levels more rapidly than garages, which he attributed to employers' in mark continued offerings of remote working options.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Garage Facility Report, stating that it includes the same revenue results as the Finance Report. He noted that all of the garages had significant increases in revenues with the exception of Forbes-Semple and Shadyside. He reminded the Board that the Forbes-Semple Garage decline was due to the current construction activity that reduces daily capacity by approximately 185 to 200 spaces. He stated that the Shadyside Garage decline is due directly to the business decline in that once-vibrant business district.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement Report, stating that 13,900 tickets were issued in December 2022, with the majority being for meter violations. He advised that 206,000 total tickets were issued in 2022 compared to 166,000 last year, up approximately 40,000 which he attributed to the increase in the resumption of street cleaning in 2022. He noted that the year's street cleaning program ended in November.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Meter Revenue Report, which showed December 2022's street collections totaled \$1.1 million while lot collections totaled \$145,000 and lot leases totaled \$27,000, for a combined total of \$1.3 million. He said the comparable total for December of

2021 was \$1.2 million while noting that 2019's base-year total was \$1.6 million. He advised that the current number of lot leases is 332 down from 336 in December 2021.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report, stating that revenues in 2022 were \$8.2 million, down from \$11 million in 2019, but roughly just \$3 million of last year's pace. He advised that the total 2022 operating expenses were \$1.8 million compared to \$2.2 million in 2019 over base-year. He stated that if we add the year's RPP operating expenses of \$513,000 the total amount of money we are giving to the City for 2022 is \$6 million compared to \$8.4 million in 2019. He reminded the Board that the city receives 100 percent of the net revenues from Parking Court.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Quarterly Garage Utilization Report, which tracks utilization at 11:00 a.m. and 2:00 p.m. in each garage, and stated that at the 2:00 p.m. time, six of the ten garages were above 80-percent full. He noted that while we are not seeing this utilization rate at earlier times in the day, we are experiencing increased activity especially at our Wood-Allies and Third Avenue Garages. He said those facilities are nearly at capacity on Tuesdays, Wednesdays and Thursdays with Mondays and Fridays being lighter in volume. He stated that prior to the pandemic our garages were consistently above 90-percent occupied on a daily basis.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Quarterly Transient and Net Revenue Report, which he stated shows that 2022 revenues are outpacing their 2021 total.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Quarterly Transaction Report, which he stated shows that we are moving in the right direction, but we still have significant ground to cover in relation to our 2019 base-year.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Downtown Housing Lease Report, noting that we began 2022 at 558 leases but are closing the year at just 503. He said the majority of our volume is Mellon Square, the Grant Street Transportation Center and First Avenue. Combined, 287 are located at those locations.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Meter Revenue Report, which shows the percentage breakdown for the different types of payment at the meters. He advised that the year-end report shows that 2.86 percent of purchases are made by coins, 35.09 percent by credit card and 62.04 percent utilizing one of the mobile-app modes.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Quarterly Parking Facility Revenue Report, which he stated we use to compare ourselves with the industry nationwide. He advised that this report shows the net revenues average per space in 2022 is \$1,500 compared to \$1,050 per space a year ago.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Pay-By-Phone Report, which he stated that \$15 million in total in meter revenues, \$9.2 million was paid via phone-apps, with the majority using ParkMobile, which he stated makes sense because of that firm's long-term exclusive presence in our market. He stated that four providers combined generated more than \$3 million in transactions in 2022, with ParkMobile having 98 percent of the transactions.

**RESOLUTION NO. 1 OF JANUARY 2023, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH’S BANK ACCOUNTS FOR THE 2023 CALENDAR YEAR,** was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the resolution lists our current bank accounts with PNC Bank and we are recommending that the Board authorizes keeping the same accounts in place for 2023.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were a lot of fees on these accounts.

Mr. Onorato responded that there are fees on these accounts and that we are in constant communication with PNC to control those rates.

Mr. Cohen asked if the Authority, being a governmental account, is permitted to have a sweep component and if we receive interest on our accounts, which he stated is currently estimated at about 2.3 percent.

Mr. DiNatale responded that we have seen our interest charges go up, but said we are required to pull from them because of our Trust obligations.

Ms. Williams added that we do have two sweep provisions on the two larger accounts and as the checking account activity demands the sweep money is automatically taken from these accounts.

Mr. Cohen asked if that covers our fees.

Ms. Williams responded that we have so much activity, with so many deposits and lockbox activity, that it does offset the bank fees doesn't fully eliminate them.

Mr. DiNatale noted that in January 2022 we received \$500 and in December 2022 we received \$85,000 in fee refunds. He stated that we have had discussions with PNC regarding the Durbin Amendment and said we now believe that we may have the lowest transaction fees in the country. He stated that last year we received a total refund of \$203,000 and this year we have been receiving approximately \$60,000 per quarter via check. He stated that in 2023 this calculation will be built into PNC's system and will be a real time component for every transaction, therefore eliminating the issuance of a check every quarter.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Wilson, Resolution No. 1 of 2023 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 2 OF JANUARY 2023, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE FINAL PAYMENT TO DELL TECHNOLOGIES FOR THE PURCHASE OF SERVER INFRASTRUCTURE FOR THE ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE VIRTUAL ENVIRONMENT,** was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this is a final payment request for the server infrastructure project to update our servers. He said that they have all been installed and the punch list items completed to the satisfaction of the Authority. He advised that the original contract amount was \$342,000 and final payment of \$32,605.80 is being requested. He advised that there was one change order to this contract.

Mr. Wilson asked if this upgrade was related to the website that the City will no longer be hosting.

Mr. Onorato responded that it is not directly related to the website. He advised that the new website should be live by the end of next week.

Mr. McNaugher added that the new website is being hosted by Granicus and will no longer be hosted at the City.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Ms. Fishback, Resolution No. 2 of 2023 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional new or old business matters to discuss.

There were none.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:29 a.m. with all Board members in approval.

**APPROVED TO CONTENT**

DocuSigned by:

*Liz Fishback*

**Chairman**

**ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF MINUTES**

DocuSigned by:

*[Signature]*

**Approval**