

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 20, 2020**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a regular meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:09 a.m. on February 20, 2020 at 232 Boulevard of the Allies, Pittsburgh, PA 15222-1616. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Jeff Cohen, Cathy Qureshi, Matt Barron and Erika Strassburger. Present from staff were David Onorato, Christopher Speers, Chris Holt, Gwendolyn Bolden, Jo-Ann Williams, Mark DiNatale, Philip Savino, Janet Staab, Tracy Sowinski, Kathryn Van Why and Pat Konesky. Also present were Jim Gibbs of Meter Feeder; Sam Ube of PPT; Mark Sakino and Roman Kyshakevich of Allegheny Geoquest and Alicia Carberry of the City of Pittsburgh. Jason Wrona of Buchanan Ingersoll participated via phone.

MINUTES

Mr. Cohen asked for approval of the minutes from the January 16, 2020 meeting.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Ms. Qureshi, the minutes were approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

Mr. Cohen welcomed Mr. Wilson to the Parking Authority Board of Directors and stated that he is proud of what the Board has accomplished and is looking forward to Mr. Wilson making a major contribution to the Board in his new position.

Mr. Onorato also welcomed Mr. Wilson to the Parking Authority Board and said he and the staff were available at any time to answer any questions he might have.

Mr. Wilson responded stating that he is happy with his appointment and is looking forward to the partnership and has been pleased with the introductory overview prepared for him by Mr. Onorato and staff. He noted that he was impressed with how much the Parking Authority has modernized and stated that its progress is reflected in its revenues. Mr. Wilson also wished Ms. Strassburger success in her new assignment.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any public comments.

There were none.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato shared a letter from the City regarding a customer's positive experience with the Authority's Residential Permit process.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the Authority recently instituted five new personnel policies specifically those covering Overtime/Comp Time; Paid Parental Leave Absence; Paid Safe Leave; Time Donation; and the Rooney Rule.

Ms. Qureshi asked if the Authority had a policy handbook and if these new policies were incorporated into it. She also suggested that the Board be given a copy, adding that these new policies seem to be both positive and progressive.

Mr. Barron asked if there is an orientation with new employees and if these policies are shared at that time.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority does provide a handbook at orientation and said these policies will be incorporated into the existing version. He also noted that the Authority plans to update the entire handbook in 2020 and that final, updated copy will be shared with Board members. He stated that the new policies will be distributed via an addendum to the existing handbook.

Ms. Qureshi asked if these policies covered all employees.

Mr. Onorato responded that some of these policies apply only to non-union personnel and said that distribution guidelines make it clear to whom each policy applies.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the Ninth and Penn Project is moving ahead with plans to get on the City Planning's March agenda for review. He stated that the design is still being reviewed and, once it's approved, the RFPs can be issued for the various construction stages.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the first closure of the Ft. Duquesne and Sixth Garage for the electrical vault replacement proceeded without any issues. He stated that the second scheduled closure will not be taking place on the dates scheduled because of delays by Duquesne Light that will be discussed in one of today's resolutions.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that all 90 of the kiosks located in the Downtown zone now accept credit or debit cards only. He advised that, as a test, the coin usage mechanism was blocked and that we are monitoring the public feedback. He said response to date has been minimal.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Mon Wharf was closed one day in January and five days to date in February due to flooding.

Mr. Onorato advised that he is working with an individual representing the Squirrel Hill Mural Project regarding a proposed mural on the Library Lot at no cost to the Authority.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority's yearly audit will begin on Monday and said with the auditors from Maher Duessel are scheduled to be on-site on that day.

Mr. Onorato shared with the Board a Duncan Solutions report containing its year-end statistics.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority forwarded its yearly contribution to the City, which for 2019 was just over \$30 million.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that there was an internet outage this past weekend, which affected the garages for several hours as credit cards could not be accepted or processed. He advised that we will be working with the vendor to recoup the lost revenue, adding that the amount involved was not significant.

Mr. Wrona suggested that the Authority might want to consider reaching out to Mark McCall to see if the Authority has business-interruption insurance.

Mr. Onorato responded that the Authority does have insurance but said he does not believe that the lost revenue amount is significant enough to file a claim.

Mr. Speers added that the Authority installed ATMs in the majority of its downtown locations last year and having that equipment in place prevented us from incurring a larger loss.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Finance Report, noting that we are on pace with budgeted targets, with garage, street meter and lot revenue all up overall compared to last year. He noted that January's results incorporated the rate increase that went into effect in November and said the year's monthly increase should be from \$110,000 to 125,000 depending on the business days in the month. He said that Ninth and Penn generated \$170,000 in revenue last January.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Facilities Report, noting that it basically shows the same trends as the Finance Report, specifically representing a six-percent increase from last year. He noted that Mon Wharf results are higher, reflecting the number of flooding-related closures a year ago.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement Report, noting that ticket issuance is slightly up with meters and RPP districts accounting for approximately 80 percent of tickets issued. He stated that management has been streamlining enforcement operations and recently upgraded the handheld ticket writing units to now allow an officer to scan a license plate rather than having to physically enter the plate number into the device.

Mr. Cohen asked if the Authority can determine the means in which a ticket was paid by credit card, cash or check.

Mr. Onorato stated that we are able to track how a customer pays for parking and the breakdown is shown on the quarterly revenue report. He said we do not track what payment method used to pay a ticket fine.

Ms. Qureshi asked if the pay-by-phone app has been experiencing any issues with customers using Master Card.

Mr. Onorato advised that he is not aware of any issues but said that he will check into it further.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report, noting that the year-to-date revenue is \$766,000, which is slightly behind last years but should be considered a good start for this year.

Ms. Qureshi noted that she is always struck by how much this amount seems to fluctuate.

Mr. Onorato advised that the fluctuation could be because of the timing of when late fine notices are issued and by the collection of booting offenses as well.

RESOLUTION NO. 7 OF FEBRUARY 2020, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE FINAL PAYMENT TO NATHAN CONTRACTING, LP FOR STAIR TOWER REPAIRS OF THE WOOD/ALLIES PARKING GARAGE, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the repairs to the stair towers at the Wood/Allies Garage have been completed. He stated that the original contract amount was \$82,888.00 and we are asking for authorization for a final payment of \$8,288.80. He noted that there were no change orders on this project and said the MBE participation was 15 percent or approximately \$12,5000 while WBE participation was one percent.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Ms. Qureshi, Resolution No. 7 of 2020 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 8 OF FEBRUARY 2020, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE FINAL PAYMENT TO ASCC, INC. FOR THE UNIFIED CAMERA SYSTEM AT AUTHORITY FACILITIES, was read by Ms. Qureshi and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority is seeking authorization to make final payment in the amount of \$88,452.56. He advised that the original contract amount was \$457,235.00 with one change order of \$21,787.41, or 4.7 percent of the original contract. He advised that the change order was initiated by the Authority for the purchase and installation of five additional cameras, four to be installed at the main office and one at First Avenue, and two security field boxes, one at the Mon Wharf and another at Second Avenue. He noted that the Board had previously approved this change order request.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Mr. Cohen, Resolution No. 8 of 2020 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 9 OF FEBRUARY 2020, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE A CHANGE ORDER TO NATHAN CONTRACTING, LP FOR STRUCTURAL REPAIRS TO AN EXISTING ELECTRICAL VAULT FOR THE FORT DUQUESNE & SIXTH GARAGE, was read by Mr. Wilson and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the work on the electrical vaults has been delayed, explaining that the Authority has been working with Duquesne Light and its contractor for approximately eight months to a year for all of the project specs to be developed and approved. He advised that we closed the garage in January to do the replacement and said that although Duquesne Light was on-site and was aware of what we were doing, the firm said the original scope of work no longer satisfied its needs and provided a new scope of work for us to follow. He noted that this change will cause the project cost to increase by \$40,000 to now amount to \$124,888. Mr. Onorato advised that any bid received for the work would have its total cost rise by this \$40,000 change, thus maintaining the level playing field leading to the original award decision. He said the Authority has reached out to Duquesne Light to express our frustration on the way it handled this project, given that there as adequate time to review its scope and timing. The firm cited the change as a safety issue with which we were required to comply.

Mr. Barron asked why they approved the original scope of work asked if there were changes.

Mr. Onorato responded that nothing in the scope changed and stated that he believes that it was just a different representative who viewed the work differently than the first representative did.

Ms. Qureshi stated that this is the nature of the beast when dealing with regulatory matters, which makes it all the more important for the Authority to do whatever upfront work we can to create a diverse pool of contractors.

Mr. Onorato advised that we did look at Nathan Contracting’s last eight contracts with the Authority, noting that four of them had change orders amounting for a net credit of \$70,000.

Ms. Qureshi stated that she believes the Authority does a great job in managing these projects but with aging structures, the contractor that gets the bid is often lucky because it is already mobilized for the opportunity to take on additional scope of work.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Ms. Qureshi, Resolution No. 9 of 2020 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 10 OF FEBRUARY 2020, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE A CHANGE ORDER TO ALLEGHENY CITY ELECTRIC, INC. FOR LED LIGHTING TECHNOLOGY UPGRADES AT THE FORT DUQUESNE AND SIXTH STREET PARKING GARAGE, A COMPONENT OF THE AUTHORITY-SIDE LIGHTING UPGRADE PROJECT, was read by Mr. Barron and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised the original contract was for lighting upgrades to nine facilities and there were two previous change orders to the contract. The first change order for \$171,000 was due to a change in the scope of work at the JCC Facility and the second one of \$172,000 was for the need of new electrical panels and wiring at various location once the contractor was on-site performing the upgrades. He advised that this change order is tied somewhat to the electrical vaults at Ft. Duquesne and Sixth Street, noting that at the same time we were pulling wires to connect to the new vault it was realized that a new conduit would be required to service the entire garage.

Mr. Barron asked if the Authority was aware of the amount of annual savings realized due to the LED upgrade.

Mr. Onorato responded that we do track that information and said he will forward a copy to the Board. He said the projection for the work is a guaranteed savings of \$30 to \$35,000 per month.

Ms. Williams added that the overall annual estimate was \$360,000 in electrical savings per year.

Mr. Onorato added that he believes that estimate may be on the low side, noting that we based the usage on dimming some lighting but stated that we are actually able to turn lights off at those facilities having daylight filtering in from the outside.

Mr. Wilson mentioned that he is the Chairman of the Economical Development Committee and they had a recent conversation regarding the total amount of the City’s power usage has and found it interesting that the City County Building accounts for 40 forty percent of the City’s electricity use.

Mr. Barron added that the Authority did receive a state grant which offset some of the costs of of the original contract.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Qureshi and seconded by Mr. Cohen, Resolution No. 10 of 2020 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 11 OF FEBRUARY 2020, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE A CHANGE ORDER TO LUGAILA MECHANICAL, INC. FOR UPGRADES TO THE FIRE ALARM SYSTEM AT THE OLIVER PARKING GARAGE, A COMPONENT OF THE AUTHORITY-WIDE FIRE AND PANIC ALARM SYSTEM UPGRADE PROJECT, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that during the implementation of a system-wide fire and panic alarm upgrade, the Fire Marshall on site at the Oliver Garage advised that because of the residential units above the facility, we were required by code to have an audible horn strobe instead of just a strobe light. He said the regulation required us to install 21 audible strobes.

Mr. Cohen stated that while some of these change orders amount to a lot of money, some of them we can control and others we cannot.

Mr. Onorato added that the projects are budgeted in our Capital Repairs Budget, which the Authority pay for as they occur. He said we have been able to cover these expenses through our Capital Budget process and advised that if we do not use the full amount of a budgeted fund during a particular year, that balance stays in the Trust Account. He also noted that Board approves the yearly budget, and while we bring each individual project to the Board for approval, the funds for any project is not drawn down from the Trust until the Board authorizes payment.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Qureshi and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 11 of 2020 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

OLD BUSINESS

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any old business questions to discuss.

Mr. Cohen asked when the RFPs for the Ninth and Penn construction would be issued.

Mr. Onorato advised that we are in the process of obtaining all of the approvals and permits from the City, but stated he believes that we are looking at April or May for issuing

the RFPs for construction. He noted that the specs and RFPs are about 80-percent completed, and said he anticipates one full year from the date the construction begins for total completion. He noted that the Authority does not anticipate securing funding until the RFPs are received and we have a more accurate idea of the full costs.

Mr. Barron asked if there would be one or multiple RFPs issued.

Mr. Onorato advised that there would be four for the project's principal categories: electrical; mechanical; plumbing and general contracting.

Mr. Cohen asked that the Board be kept advised of the progress.

He advised that we have been working with the City and the Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership for their requirements and said has been sharing the façade and park designs with Mr. Barron.

Mr. Cohen asked if Mr. Barron was onboard with the designs.

Mr. Barron responded that they have his support as designed thus far.

NEW BUSINESS

Ms. Qureshi said she wanted to recognize both Ms. Oliphant and Ms. Strassburger for their service to the Parking Authority as Board Members and also to welcome Mr. Wilson to the Board, commenting that the Board is a very supportive group and offered her assistance if needed.

Mr. Cohen agreed and in welcoming Mr. Wilson, again noted that Mr. Onorato and staff do an excellent job in enabling the Authority to contribute the revenues it does to the City.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority is in early talks with Duquesne Light for an agreement for EV Charging stations at the Ft. Duquesne and Sixth Garage.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority is working with the City to make the Second Avenue Lot available for parking for the City's electrical fleet. He advised that it will be a significant capital outlay will be required to get the infrastructure in place, noting that the City currently has about 80 leases and is offering to increase its monthly lease rate by \$10.00. He stated that we are still in negotiations and any agreement reached will be presented to the Board for approval.

Mr. Speers advised that the Authority used the Driving PA Forward Grant for the Smithfield/Liberty and the Third Avenue EV installs, which totaled 16 additional EV spaces in those two garages at no cost to the Authority.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority currently has a total of 35 EV spaces in our facilities and said patrons pays for their parking at the current rate and the Authority pays for the electricity for the EV chargers at no additional cost to the patron.

Mr. Speers advised that utilization of the new EV locations at Third Avenue and Smithfield is growing more rapidly than locations equipped previously.

Mr. Barron asked if the private garages offer EV charging.

Mr. Speers responded that both SEA and Alco facilities have a few EV spaces but said that the Authority is the high-volume provider of the service.

Mr. Cohen asked if the Authority is turning away any residential leases for downtown residents.

Mr. Speers replied that we are now at over 270 Downtown Housing Leases and said that the Authority will continue to accept leases as long as we have adequate spaces available.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional new business issues to discuss.

There were none.

The next Board meeting is scheduled for Thursday March 19, 2020 at 10:00 a.m.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:59 am with all Board Members in approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT



Chairman

**ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF
MINUTES**

Approval

Mr. Speers advised that utilization of the new EV locations at Third Avenue and Smithfield is growing more rapidly than locations equipped previously.

Mr. Barron asked if the private garages offer EV charging.

Mr. Speers responded that both SEA and Alco facilities have a few EV spaces but said that the Authority is the high-volume provider of the service.

Mr. Cohen asked if the Authority is turning away any residential leases for downtown residents.

Mr. Speers replied that we are now at over 270 Downtown Housing Leases and said that the Authority will continue to accept leases as long as we have adequate spaces available.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional new business issues to discuss.

There were none.

The next Board meeting is scheduled for Thursday March 19, 2020 at 10:00 a.m.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:59 am with all Board Members in approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT

Chairman

**ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF
MINUTES**



Approval