

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
THURSDAY, JULY 18, 2019**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a regular meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:15 a.m. on July 18, 2019 at 232 Boulevard of the Allies, Pittsburgh, PA 15222-1616. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Jeff Cohen, Aradhna Oliphant, Matt Barron, Cathy Qureshi, Erika Strassburger. Present from staff were: David Onorato, Chris Holt, Gwendolyn Bolden, Jo-Ann Williams, Philip Savino, Janet Staab, Tracy Sowinski, Kathryn Van Why and Pat Konesky. Also present was Jason Wrona of Buchanan Ingersoll; Jim Gibbs of Meter Feeder, Russ Beeson of PSX, Rick Craig of Craig Communications, Nick Waskiewicz of Edgewater Security, Alison Keating of Pittsburghers for Public Transit, Alicia Carberry of the City of Pittsburgh Mayor's Office, William Stewart of Strategic Communications, Quincy Swatson and Alycia Washington.

Mr. Cohen advised that the Board held an Executive Session prior to the meeting to discuss real estate matters.

MINUTES

Mr. Cohen asked for approval of the minutes from the June 20, 2019 meeting.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Ms. Qureshi, the minutes were approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Strassburger, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any public comments.

Ms. Keating addressed the Board and expressed her concern regarding the development of the new Ninth and Penn Garage, specifically asking if the project would include affordable housing. She said that she does not believe that the Pittsburgh Cultural Trust is a very good partner in any housing initiative, stating that it has left a lot of downtown buildings empty that could have provided housing for artists or other residents. She stated that she would hope that if the Parking Authority is considering housing, the component would be inclusive and affordable for a diverse group.

Mr. Swatson addressed the Board and asked when the Authority's 2018 financials would be available to the public.

Mr. Onorato asked that Mr. Swatson submit his questions and advised that the Authority would respond at a later time.

Mr. Swatson stated that he believes that the Authority's parking fine structure disproportionately taxes low-income residents, specifically how the schedule of fine amounts increases drastically and quickly from the date of the ticketed violation. He proposed that the Board consider a sliding fee scale based on ability to pay and requested that the Board permit the Executive Director to solicit proposals from consulting companies to explore the correlation between escalating fine obligations and the varying income levels of ticketed vehicle owners. He said he believes that the current structure is affecting poor people more often than is realized. He stated that the city has a disconnected, out-of-commission transportation system that needs to be addressed and improved and said that the Board has the ability to look at the fee structure and determine ways to both verify income and data and adopt measures more suited to people on a fixed income or out of work. He stated that he had a large response to this issue on social media and stated that a public authority and not-for-profit business should not be profiting off of taxpayers who pay for the streets that this Authority charges people to park on. He suggested that the Executive Director be directed to look at fee structure change that includes a sliding payment scale according to income.

Mr. Swatson said he also wanted to talk about the Authority's practices of contracting with MBE and WBE businesses. He stated that Pittsburgh has one of the lowest participation rates of people of color and one of the nation's largest racial gaps and said the size of the Parking Authority could have a huge impact in assisting minority businesses getting off the ground.

Mr. Cohen thanked Mr. Swatson and Ms. Keating for sharing their thoughts with the Board and asked if there were any additional public comments.

There were none.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato reminded the Board that the Authority sold the Penn Circle NW Lot to the URA several years ago but have continued to operate it until it was time for a development project utilizing the land to begin. He stated that the URA notified us that a starting time has arrived and we therefore will be closing the lot beginning September 1. He also stated that an RFP for the Eva/Beatty and the Tamello/Beatty Lots, both located in East Liberty, had been issued and those sites will be taken out of service late in 2020 or early in 2021. He noted that the development projects should take approximately two years and, site when completed, will include components of public parking. He advised the projects will displace numerous parkers and will result in a revenue loss to the Authority and City.

Mr. Onorato advised that ParkMobile has begun a marketing and awareness campaign for its system's mobile phone app. He noted there have been recent radio ads and said the firm is working with the City to obtain permits for signage in its efforts to increase public awareness of the benefits of using the pay-by-phone application.

Mr. Onorato advised the board that the new EV Charging Stations in Third Avenue and Smithfield/Liberty have been installed and said there would be a dedication ceremony on July 23 in company with Duquesne Light. He advised that, working with Duquesne Light, enough grant money was secured to add 16 EV spaces at the two facilities at no charge to the Authority.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on the Finance Report, noting that garage receipts are down from last year, mostly because of the closure of Ninth and Penn three months earlier that was provided for in the budget.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Revenue-Per-Space Report, reporting that the Smithfield/Liberty, Mellon Square and Oliver Garages are the three highest revenue-per-space facilities, largely because of their location in the central downtown footprint.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Facilities Report and stated that we will determine whether it is better to keep including Ninth and Penn for comparison purposes or to remove it going forward. He noted that the year-to-date report follows the trend of a decrease in Ninth and Penn revenues and an increase at the Grant Street Transportation Center because of the addition of new leases there.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement Report, noting that meter, street cleaning and residential permit parking violations are the largest categories of tickets issued.

Mr. Cohen asked if there are particular areas within the city where any current construction work or removal of spaces for bike lanes, etc. are affecting the Authority's revenues.

Mr. Onorato responded that these activities do affect the Authority's revenues and said that we do monitor each of those projects and record the lost revenue amounts. He mentioned that the most recent event of that type is the sidewalk repairs occurring on Grandview Avenue that prevents any curbside parking.

Mr. Cohen stated he would like to see the report of lost revenue due to construction projects as well as from the spaces removed for bicycle lanes.

Mr. Onorato discussed the MBE/WBE Report, stating that the Authority does keep track of minority participation on each individual project, both with the lead contractors and their subcontractors as well.

Mr. Barron inquired how the Authority calculated the 144-percent participation level that was listed on the report. He wasn't quite sure how it could be over 100 percent.

Mr. Holt responded that this is the total combined for all the projects for 2017 and 2018.

Ms. Oliphant asked what the whole total of what 144 percent represented.

Mr. Holt replied that it is of the total contract amounts.

Ms. Oliphant and Mr. Barron asked how a number higher than 100 percent can be achieved.

Mr. Holt stated that he could break it out for them on a per-project basis, including projects where contractors are saying that they have gone above 100 percent of the targeted amount.

Mr. Barron asked if they could see that as a percentage of total project.

Ms. Oliphant verified that the total WBE is 79 percent, again using the same baseline, so is that where the flip/flop is happening where the contractors are using fewer women and more minorities.

Mr. Holt responded that the Authority's MBE participation goal is 25 percent of the total construction cost per project, where WBE is 10 percent, so the total minority participation percentage is 35 percent.

Ms. Oliphant stated that there are two different baselines that lead to the projected calculation of 144 percent. She asked if the Authority is mandated to meet on this requirement. She also noted that the Authority has to use its own baseline in setting the Authority's goal and keep it separate from the contractor's baseline interpretation.

Mr. Onorato responded that a participation total of 25 percent is not mandatory but is a goal.

Mr. Holt added that we also acknowledge the certified payroll, which the City does not.

Ms. Strassburger added that she was pleased to see the subcontractors are included in the accounting process because it's her understanding that this is an issue at the City level. She said she feels that our reporting is presented in a clear manner.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Quarterly Occupancy Utilization Report, which shows the utilization of each facility at the 11:00 am and 2:00 pm hours.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Transient Revenue Report, which shows the revenue per facility during daytime, evening and weekend periods.

Ms. Qureshi asked if the Authority closes a facility before it is completely full.

Mr. Onorato responded that we do, adding that the practice differs per facility and is based on the amount of leases involved.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Downtown Housing Lease Report, noting that the numbers have not increased drastically. He said that discussions with the Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership, which administers this program, indicated that the program would be discontinued at the end of September due to budgetary reasons.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Meter Report, noting that as of the close of the second quarter of 2019, 50 percent of the transactions employed the phone application, 43 percent were credit card transactions directly at the meter and seven percent of the transactions were paid by coin.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Pay-by-Phone Report, which showed that the average transaction using the app being \$2.68 compared to \$2.40 paid through the meter.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional questions.

There were none.

RESOLUTION NO. 23 OF JULY 2019, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO AWARD A CONTRACT TO ASCC, INC. FOR THE INSTALLATION OF A UNIFIED SECURITY CAMERA SYSTEM AT THIRTEEN (13) FACILITY LOCATIONS, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this resolution is for the purchase and installation of cameras to replace the 68 very outdated ones located in nine of our garages. He advised that this purchase would result in 140 cameras being placed in all of our staffed facilities except Second Avenue. He stated that in addition to the garages, our dual-level Shiloh Street Lot would be camera-equipped as well. He stated that the one-time purchase cost of \$441,225 averages to \$39,000 per location and said there would be a yearly cost of \$16,000 for the first three years using to \$22,000 in years four and five. Mr. Onorato advised that the cameras would cover the garage entrances and the revenue control equipment, and could be viewed from the main office, coverage we don't have access to today. He also noted that the cameras are compatible with the City of Pittsburgh's monitoring system.

Mr. Barron asked if the re-occurring cost were maintenance fees.

Mr. Onorato responded that they cover maintenance and warranty fees.

Ms. Qureshi asked what stood out about ASCC compared to the other bidders in the same general range.

Mr. Onorato stated that a committee interviewed each firm and, based on various criteria outlined in the RFP, each bid was scored accordingly.

Ms. Qureshi asked if this installation was mostly to deter crime and would cover street activity outside of the facilities. She asked how often the Authority, the City or outside agencies view these recordings.

Mr. Onorato responded that the cameras will not cover all locations of each facility, but is installed mainly to monitor vehicle and pedestrian entrances as well as the pay stations and manager's office. He did state that if something were to occur within those areas, recordings would be available for review. He advised that the footage will not be monitored on a 24-hour basis but on an as-needed basis. He noted that while it does not cover the street activity, it may capture some view, but that it is not our intent. He also noted that, only recently, the recordings were reviewed by an outside agency and said we have the ability to share them following requests to the Executive Director.

Mr. Cohen asked if there was any difference in the camera equipment proposed by the vendors.

Mr. Savino replied that some proposed using Samsung with others proposing Axis, the type recommended by the intended awardee and an industry-leading brand of equipment.

Mr. Barron asked if the Authority has any written policies regarding this procedure.

Mr. Onorato responded that we do not have a written policy to address this but that it something that we could develop.

Ms. Qureshi asked if being a Women Owned Business or the business having residency in with the City factored into the scoring.

Mr. Onorato responded that a company's minority status was accounted for in the scoring as well as it having a Pennsylvania presence.

Mr. Cohen asked how much of a difference there was in the bids received on this second round compared to the first time we issued the RFP.

Mr. Onorato replied that the bids were approximately \$15,000 lower this time than the first.

Mr. Barron asked if we would we extend the warranty after five years.

Mr. Onorato responded that we would extend the warranty and the hardware would remain in place as long as it's still in good condition. He noted that industry standard for hardware expectancy is five years.

Mr. Cohen stated that it breaks down to \$100,000 a year for something that no one looks at.

Ms. Oliphant asked how our technology compares to the European market.

Mr. Savino responded that the Europeans are usually steps ahead in coverage techniques but are becoming more cautious and erroring on the side of privacy.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Ms. Qureshi, Resolution No. 23 of 2019 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Strassburger, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 24 OF JULY 2019, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO SOLICIT BIDS FOR SNOW PLOWING AND/OR SNOW REMOVAL AT AUTHORITY-OPERATED

GARAGES AND SURFACE LOTS, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the current contract, which is for snow removal at our surface lots and on some of our garage rooftops, expires in September. He advised that the current vendor is Snow and Ice Management, our contractor for the last five years. He advised that the average annual amount spent for this service is \$77,000.

Mr. Cohen stated that he recalled that we purchased machines to perform this activity.

Mr. Onorato advised that the equipment we purchased is used to do minor snow removal when accumulation is under three inches. He noted that this service is on an as-needed basis and there is no charge if they are not called out.

Ms. Qureshi asked if resolutions such as this one, just soliciting bids for a service, needs to be brought before the Board or if it would be sufficient to bring just the resolution authorizing the actual contract award.

Mr. Onorato stated that we do have a dollar limit of \$25,000 governing when a purchase or contract is brought to the board, rather than just requiring the Executive Director's approval.

Ms. Qureshi stated that the procedure should be looked at and possibly some adjustments should be made.

Mr. Onorato stated that he does not believe that there is any need to bring solicitation request resolutions to the Board and said he could just keep the Board informed of any solicitation-only RFPs that are issued.

Mr. Barron stated that he likes seeing the solicitation resolution on items that we believe may involve a large contract or purchase price.

Ms. Qureshi asked that before any procedures are changed, our legal counsel can review at the procedures that are currently in place and see if there are any changes or modifications that can or should be made.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 24 of 2019 was tabled as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Strassburger, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 25 OF JULY 2019, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO SOLICIT BIDS FOR STAIR TOWER

REPAIRS AT WOOD-ALLIES PARKING GARAGE, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this condition was identified in our annual garage inspection and could be a potential safety concern if left unaddressed. He advised that the Authority would like to take proactive steps to repair the stairs and landings in this facility.

Mr. Cohen asked if the Authority had an idea of the cost involved for this particular work.

Mr. Onorato confirmed that we do have an idea of what this type of work should cost, but we will not release that information prior to the bidding process.

Ms. Qureshi stated that the Authority staff does great work in many areas, but she has always felt that the cleanliness of the garage stairwells is an issue. She said that it is a hard situation to keep up with, but it is something that patrons notice and feels the Authority staff can improve on. She added that this is not a recent observation on her part.

Mr. Cohen said he agreed and asked that staff look at improving upon this condition. He also inquired if the Authority has adequate equipment to address stairway issues.

Mr. Onorato replied that our hoses may not reach the entire stairwell but said we do have other equipment that can aid in this task.

Ms. Oliphant mentioned that maybe installing new lighting would help.

Mr. Onorato responded that the garage lighting was recently upgraded and said the stairwells are generally well lit.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Ms. Qureshi, Resolution No. 25 of 2019 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Strassburger, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 26 OF JULY 2019, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO UTILIZE ELECTRICAL SERVICES FOR AUTHORITY GARAGES AND SURFACE LOTS FROM THE CITY OF PITTSBURGH'S CONTRACT WITH ALLEGHENY CITY ELECTRIC, INC., was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that Allegheny City Electric is the Authority's current vendor, said its contract has expired and we are therefore asked for approval to piggy-pack on the City's contract which expires in 2021. He advised that the average cost for this service over the last three years

for this was \$125,000 per year, which we now anticipate it being significantly lower going forward because of the recent system-wide installation of new garage lighting system-wide.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Ms. Strassburger, Resolution No. 26 of 2019 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Strassburger, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

OLD/NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any new or old business questions to discuss.

Mr. Cohen shared with the Board, staff and public a copy of the International Parking and Mobility Institutes magazine featuring a cover photo of Mr. Onorato and positive coverage of the Authority's progress inside. Mr. Cohen advised that Mr. Onorato has been elected Chairman of the Board of this international organization, noting that it is a huge honor for Mr. Onorato personally as well as for the City and stated that the City and Authority staff should be proud of his accomplishments.

Ms. Oliphant congratulated Mr. Onorato and thanked him and the staff for their efforts.

Mr. Onorato advised that this was a team effort and that it could not have been achieved without the help and input of all members of our staff.

Mr. Onorato introduced and welcomed our new Human Resources Manager, Deb Kerestes.

Ms. Strassburger stated that she wanted to acknowledge one of the meeting's public comments and stated that she takes the issues that were raised very seriously. She said she wanted to explore the possibility of looking into the Authority's current practices involving payments of tickets and how they compare to those in place in other cities to determine if there is a true equity question that should be addressed. She asked if there are comparable studies indicating the effectiveness of sliding-scale payment plans or other options. She stated that she does not know history of our payment practices but is certainly willing to have a conversation about policies and procedures going forward.

Ms. Oliphant said she agreed, stating that she believes that there is something to be said for investigating but does not know of any issues or even whose responsibility it becomes.

Ms. Strassburger said that there is a snowball effect in how expensive poverty can be and said she does not want the Authority to be a factor in making situations worse.

Ms. Cohen stated that while he is not in that situation, he could see having how the escalation of fines could affect others. He stated that, in theory, it would be great to penalize based on income but was not sure how that would work. He did state that we do have a policy wherein one can go online to dispute or schedule a hearing and that freezes the ticket cost at the initial level. He said the process provides the opportunity to pay the ticket at a later time when a Parking Court decision is reached. He stated that he does support instituting a payment plan process that will assist those who are not able to pay the full fine all at once.

Ms. Strassburger stated that she does want to be educated as to past payment practices and be advised if any changes are possible.

Mr. Barron stated that he would like to see what the Authority is legally permitted to do under the state laws governing fine payment practices.

Mr. Cohen asked if there is any type of payment plan currently available at the Parking Court.

Mr. Onorato responded that there is not any type of payment plan currently available but said that the Court does accept credit cards as payment. He also noted that we have recently looked at reducing the number of tickets received to qualify for booting violation. He said the change would reduce the overall amount due in booting situations from the average price in excess of \$1,000 that is now the case.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional questions or comments.

There were none.

The next Board meeting is scheduled for Thursday August 15, 2019 at 10:00 a.m.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:14 am with all Board Members in approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT



Chairman

ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF MINUTES



Approval