

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE  
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH  
THURSDAY, DECEMBER 18, 2018**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a regular meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:07 a.m. on December 18, 2018, at 232 Boulevard of the Allies, Pittsburgh, PA 15222-1616. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Jeff Cohen, Matt Barron, Cathy Qureshi and Aradhna Oliphant. Present from staff were: David Onorato, Christopher Speers, Chris Holt, Jo-Ann Williams, Janet Staab, Tracy Sowinski, Kathryn Van Why, Matt Jendrzewski, Harry Wormsley, Leatha Marshall, Linda Hurney, Sue Lipinski and Pat Konesky. Also present was Jason Wrona of Buchanan Ingersoll, Bryan Martucci of H.R. Gray, Mark McCall of TJS Insurance Group, Bobby Kunkle, of ODC, Jim Lombardi of SAI Consulting Engineers, Philip Wilkinson of AE7, Alicia Carberry of the City of Pittsburgh and William Stewart of Strategic Communications.

Mr. Cohen advised that the Board held an Executive Session prior to today's meeting to discuss client/attorney matters regarding a real estate issue.

**MINUTES**

Mr. Cohen asked for approval of the minutes from the November 15, 2018 meeting.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Mr. Barron, the minutes were approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any public comments.

There were none.

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the Teamsters Union ratified the new contract.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority received a check, including all legal fees, from JCS Capital for its purchase of Grant Street Transportation Center air rights.

Mr. Onorato advised that all of this month's reports, show half way through November, that all performance categories are on target with budget and heading in the right direction.

Mr. Cohen asked if there was anything in the reports that Mr. Onorato thought needed explanation.

Mr. Onorato advised that the garage and meter revenues are on target from last year, as are ticket count and revenue and Parking Court receipts.

Ms. Qureshi noted that she notices an enormous amount of construction throughout the city and wanted to know if this affects the Authority in any way.

Mr. Onorato responded that we have been working more closely with the City to collect any meter revenue lost due to construction projects.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

**RESOLUTION NO. 51 OF DECEMBER 2018, "A RESOLUTION ACKNOWLEDGING MS. LEATHA MARSHALL FOR HER 27 YEARS OF PROFESSIONAL AND EXEMPLARY SERVICE IN HER EMPLOYMENT WITH BOTH THE CITY OF PITTSBURGH AND THE PITTSBURGH PARKING AUTHORITY,** was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato introduced Ms. Marshall and thanked her for her service throughout the years, both at the City and here at the Authority. He advised that she began her career at the City as a Meter Maid and transferred to the Parking Authority in 1995. Mr. Onorato presented Ms. Marshall with a gift as a token of the organization's appreciation for her years of service.

Mr. Cohen congratulated Ms. Marshall and thanked her on behalf of the Board.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Qureshi and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 51 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 52 OF DECEMBER 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT WITH AN INSURANCE BROKER OR BROKERS OF RECORD AS RECOMMENDED BY THE INSURANCE COMMITTEE FOR THE PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH FOR A**

**THREE-YEAR PERIOD PLUS TWO ONE-YEAR OPTIONS**, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the renewal process actually began in the spring of 2018 and said 33 insurance companies competed for our various insurance components. He advised that the new policies will go into effect on January 1, 2019, with commitments made to the brokers being 36 months or three years, plus two additional one-year options. He said the total annual premium of \$514,656 compared to an expiring premium of \$655,673, reflecting a total premium reduction of \$141,017 or 21.5 percent, from expiring contracts. He advised that the brokers selected to represent the Parking Authority were The James L. Smith Agency, The Rogers Insurance Group, and A.J. Gallagher and reported that the program changes from the expiring coverage included increasing the Umbrella limit from \$5 million to \$10 million while Auto, General Liability, Employee Benefits Liability, Employers Liability, Public Officials, and Employment Practice Liability; Public Officials and EPLI coverage increased from 6,000,000 to 11,000,000. Mr. Onorato then said Public Officials and EPLI program deductibles decreased from 25,000 to 5,000.

He advised that the General Liability, Umbrella, Automobile, Public Officials, Employment Practices coverages will change carriers from The Travelers to Old Republic, property and Workers Compensation will continue with Affiliated FM and HARIE respectively. He noted that Cyber will remain with Hiscox and the deductible on multi-space meters will decrease from 15,000 to 10,000 per occurrence. Mr. Onorato also advised that it was recommended that Cyber Liability be increased from \$1 million to \$5 million and that Workers Compensation Employers' Liability was now scheduled on Umbrella and said the General Liability deductible of 5,000 per occurrence will be removed upon renewal.

He advised that the program's exposure regarding total property values increased from 184,000,000 to 189,633,500, total payroll to rate Workers Compensation increased from 6,454,275 to 6,774,538 and Workers Compensation experience modification increased from 1.106 to 1.133.

Mr. Onorato introduced Mr. McCall of Tucker, Johnson and Smeltzer, our current Insurance Broker and thanked him for working to bring this Authority insurance package together for the Authority.

Mr. McCall advised that 33 carriers participated in this process. He personally thanked Mr. Holt, Ms. Williams, Ms. Konesky and Mr. Onorato for their help throughout this long renewal process, noting that there is significant improvement, including pricing, in the renewal program.

Ms. Oliphant asked what EPLI stood for and asked for a little further conversation regarding the cyber insurance.

Mr. McCall responded that the initials stand for Employment Practices Liability, which covers allegations or EORC complaints against the employees, directors and officers as well as Board members. He also stated that we hear more lately about breach of information through technology, adding that, with the Parking Authority having information flowing through the meters, it was appropriate to increase our liability limits, that will now include notification costs should there be a breach. He said any type of extortion claims would be covered as well.

Mr. Cohen noted his concern that the General Liability Coverage cost was cut in half in that the Authority may well have been overcharged in the past or the coverage may now be reduced.

Mr. McCall confirmed that the coverage is actually more and said there is no longer a \$5,000-per-occurrence deductible. He noted that the underwriters look at the historical losses and said the last time this process took place was in 2013 and said during the five years prior to that the risk was higher. He noted that the loss profile has improved significantly and said the change in carrier was also a factor.

Ms. Qureshi asked if there were any Board members on the Insurance Committee.

Mr. Onorato responded that the Insurance Committee was made up of internal staff adding that Board members were not able to participate because of their schedules,

Ms. Qureshi asked Mr. McCall if he, like A.J. Gallagher, James Smith and Rogers, was a broker and if a contract be brought to the Board from those providers.

Mr. McCall responded that he is an independent consultant and the other three mentioned are insurance brokers, adding that they represent and have contracts with the individual insurance companies the Authority will engage beginning January 1, 2019. He stated that the Authority's agreement is with those brokers and the yearly premium will change based on payrolls, property values, increases in multi-space meters and any exposure.

Ms. Oliphant noted that she does not recognize the name of one of the insurance carriers and wanted to be sure that this carrier was reputable.

Mr. McCall assured the Board that all of the carriers are reputable and stated their ratings are referenced to indicate their financial solvency.

Ms. Qureshi asked if the Worker's Compensation Insurance covers all employees, both union and non-union.

Mr. McCall confirmed that it does cover all employees.

Mr. Cohen asked if the City is doing the same with its insurance coverage.

Mr. Barron responded that the City is self-insured.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 52 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 53 OF DECEMBER 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO PURCHASE TWO (2) NEW FLEET VEHICLES, BOTH 2019 CHEVROLET CRUZE, FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF ENFORCEMENT FROM DAY CHEVROLET INCORPORATED,** was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority currently has 16 vehicles in the enforcement fleet and 35 overall and we are looking to replace unit numbers 212 and 410, which were determined to be in poor condition by our service vendor. He advised that we intend to replace those with Chevy Cruzes at a not-to-exceed cost of \$34,087.72, plus an additional \$1,500 for the decals and emblems that identify them as Authority vehicles.

Mr. Cohen asked what the Authority does with the vehicles that are no longer in service,

Mr. Onorato responded that these vehicles will be sold at auction.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 53 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 54 OF DECEMBER 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE FINAL PAYMENT TO MCELWAIN MECHANICAL SOLUTIONS, LLC FOR REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT OF THE SUMP PUMP AT THIRD AVENUE GARAGE,** was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that McElwain, an WBE firm, replaced the sump pump at Third Avenue garage at a total price of \$24,500, with all work completed satisfactorily and no change orders.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 54 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 55 OF DECEMBER 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE FINAL PAYMENT TO CARL WALKER CONSTRUCTION, INC. FOR REPAIR**

**AND PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE OF THE SHILOH PARKING PLAZA**, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that Carl Walker completed the replacement of the Shiloh Street Parking Plaza deck at a total cost of \$401,616, adding that one change order for approximately \$50,000 represented one-percent of the contract. He said it was initiated by the Authority for a change in the scope of work and we are now asking for authorization to make final payment for the completed and approved work.

Mr. Cohen asked what the change order included.

Mr. Onorato advised that there was an unforeseen condition with the beams and while the deck was open we took the opportunity to have the repairs replaced.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 55 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 56 OF DECEMBER 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO AWARD A CONTRACT TO FIRE FIGHTER SALES AND SERVICE COMPANY FOR UPGRADES OF THE FIRE SUPPRESSION AND SPRINKLER SYSTEMS AT THE MELLON SQUARE PARKING GARAGE**, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that as part of our capital improvement program the Authority will be replacing the fire suppression system at Mellon Square garage and said the work will include extending the sprinkler system to two levels not currently protected. He advised that the existing system has served its useful life and said its replacement is consistent with our practice of keeping our fire safety system up to date.

Mr. Barron asked if there was any idea why the Authority received only one bid.

Mr. Onorato advised that we did reach out to both vendors who submitted bids and said that one asked for an extension to complete the work. He advised that the Authority timeline was already generous and said we didn't want to extend it. He noted that this is a specialized service that limits the number of firms capable of performing the work required.

Ms. Oliphant asked when work of this type was completed prior at this facility.

Mr. Onorato responded that we are replacing the original system installed when the facility was built. He said repairs occurred over the years but are becoming more frequent and more costly.

Mr. Barron asked if rebidding this would yield additional bids.

Mr. Onorato responded that he did not believe it would result in additional bids but could actually raise the costs involved.

Ms. Qureshi asked the scope of work what was actually being replaced and if there was a substantial technology component.

Mr. Holt responded that the stand pipes and stair towers which help guide the fire department to the fire hose hook ups, the bells and controls inside the control room, the electrical components are included in the project. He said it should take 240 days to complete and he advised that the fire alarm system is separate and in line for replacement in 2019. He added that these systems are inspected routinely by BBI.

Ms. Qureshi asked if the Authority ever experienced any fires within its facilities.

Mr. Onorato replied that there was a vehicle fire in the Grant Street Transportation Center and an office fire at Forbes/Semple Garage.

Mr. Barron asked how many spaces would take out of service during this project.

Mr. Holt responded that 75 spaces would be lost on a rolling basis.

Ms. Qureshi asked if there was some type of fire with smoke that would not be related to this, if we have fire alarms to alert patrons and if there is a mechanical override.

Mr. Holt advised that there will be smoke detectors in the elevator lobbies and the public space areas to alert patrons in case of a fire. He said there are currently panic alarms in the lobbies that will be replaced in a 2019 construction phase.

Mr. Barron remembered that City Council has a bill being introduced, which requires retrofits to older buildings and therefore we may be required to do this upgrade in the near future even if we were not proceeding with today's resolution.

Mr. Cohen noted he was concerned that only one bid was received. He asked if we had an anticipated cost.

Mr. Holt responded that this project was budgeted at \$1.3 million.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 56 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 57 OF DECEMBER 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO PURCHASE ONE (1) ADDITIONAL PARKING SERVICES FLEET VEHICLE FOR ONGOING SNOW REMOVAL AND OPERATIONAL MAINTENANCE AT ITS GARAGE FACILITIES AND LOTS,** was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that Authority staff cleans and removes snow from the roof decks as well as the sidewalks. He advised that we currently have equipment at different garage locations and we would like to add one additional unit to be housed at the Ft. Duquesne and Sixth Garage.

Ms. Qureshi, stating that since the Authority has a contract with a vendor to remove snow, asked for clarification of this equipment's use.

Mr. Onorato responded that the outside vendor plows our surface lots and sidewalks and also assists with the garage rooves if we need them, but at an additional cost. He noted that if we were to utilize them for snow removal from the rooves it would be last on the schedule, and we would be able to simultaneously clear the rooves and prepare them for opening. He also noted that a lot of the vendors equipment is large in size and cannot fit in the garages which causes further delay in removing snow from the rooves.

Ms. Qureshi inquired how many units the Authority has in its fleet.

Mr. Onorato responded that we currently have five Kawasaki Mules and two Polaris units, with this, if approved, being our third.

Mr. Speers added that we do use Snow and Ice Management as our vendor for our garages and at this time the only garage that we have been calling on them to assist with snow removal is our Shadyside Garage where we have difficulty cleaning with a normal snow blower. He noted that when we started purchasing these units back in 2009 we strategically placed units at garages in a triangle pattern to permit the sharing of vehicles among garages. He added that this unit will go to Ft. Duquesne and Sixth, which will complete that triangle and the five-year-old Mule currently located there will be relocated to Shadyside Garage, eliminating the need to call out Snow and Ice Management to clear that roof.

Ms. Qureshi asked what department is responsible for clearing the snow from the garage roofs.

Mr. Speers advised that this is a responsibility of the garage attendants part of the Teamsters staff, who are trained and licensed to use this equipment. He added that before we started purchasing these units we were spending upwards of \$100,000 per year for snow removal and we are now at \$50,000 to \$60,000 per year range. He also added that the new units are more durable and offer a longer service life.

Mr. Cohen asked that if these units make us more efficient and effective, why we don't look at purchasing additional units at once.



Ms. Oliphant asked if our goal is to get the \$50,000 to \$60,000 to a zero-line item.

Mr. Speers responded that this would not be possible because that costs includes the purchase of sodium and calcium chloride, which are used at a facility depending on the type of roof.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 57 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 58 OF DECEMBER 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO NEGOTIATIONS FOR ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN SERVICES WITH TIMOTHY HAAHS AND ASSOCIATES, INCORPORATED FOR THE REDEVELOPMENT OF THE NINTH AND PENN PARKING GARAGE,** was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority had been negotiating over the past few years with the Davis Company and most recently with the Davis and Oxford Companies and the Cultural Trust in preparation for the development of the entire block that includes our Ninth and Penn Garage. He noted that because an agreement could not be reached between all parties and time is of the essence with the current condition of the garage, the Authority will be moving in a different direction with a stand-alone, self-built garage that we are now recommending awarding a contract for Architectural Design Services of the facility at a price approximately equal to 3.25 percent of the construction. Mr. Onorato said we are continuing to work with the Trust to determine if there is a footprint that works for our two entities.

Ms. Qureshi asked what the price factor was and if the six bidders were asked to give a price range.

Mr. Onorato replied that most of the firms gave a specific percentage and there was a range from 5.85 percent to a low of 3.87 with the others in between.

Ms. Oliphant asked if the price factor was weighted.

Mr. Wrona stated that he recalls the price being 25 percent, experience in the industry 40 percent and MBE was 10 percent.

Ms. Qureshi asked if all of the Architectural firms were Pittsburgh-based and were any minority certified.

Mr. Onorato stated that Timothy Haahs is located in Blue Bell, PA and the others are all Pittsburgh-based. He advised that Timothy Haahs is minority owned.

Ms. Qureshi asked if there was Board representation on the scoring committee.

Mr. Onorato responded that the Board members were invited to participate in the presentation process but were not available for the scoring portion as it conflicted with their schedules. He noted that the Director of City Planning, Ray Gastil, participated in the scoring.

Mr. Barron added that he read the proposals and felt that this one was strong, noting that he would most likely have scored this one the highest. He said he is comfortable with the selection and thanked everyone that has been involved in this quite long process.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Ms. Qureshi, Resolution No. 58 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 59 OF DECEMBER 2018, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO NEGOTIATIONS FOR CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT SERVICES WITH MASSARO CORPORATION FOR THE REDEVELOPMENT OF THE NINTH AND PENN PARKING GARAGE,** was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that we are recommending awarding a contract to Massaro Corporation to provide construction management services for the redevelopment of the Ninth and Penn Garage. He advised that its rate is 2.73 percent of the garage construction costs and said that four proposals were received for this work.

Mr. Barron asked if Massaro is awarded the contract for Construction Manager if it then would not be eligible to bid on the actual construction work.

Mr. Onorato confirmed that would be the case.

Mr. Cohen commented that having a construction manager would advise us on the overall strategy and guide the Authority through the process.

Mr. Onorato added that it will be our source expertise regarding the information we receive from the Architect.

Ms. Qureshi noted that because both the Architect and the Construction Manager received a percentage of the total construction costs, the incentive to go higher may exist. She said, however that the level of their business ethics may prevent it.

Mr. Barron asked how the monies are disbursed.

Mr. Onorato advised that this will be negotiated but he believes that they would be paid progressively progress steps with the bulk received at the end.

Ms. Oliphant asked how the Authority addresses any concerns regarding the costs being raised as a result of increased fees.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority would need to work closely with the vendors and stay on top of everything.

Mr. Wrona advised that some of this results from checks and balances embedded in the system to make sure it doesn't happen, and said he believes that the Authority already has a good strong idea of what the supplier costs should be.

Ms. Oliphant asked if Massaro Corporation would be given access to any information or reports that the Authority already has in its possession.

Mr. Wrona advised that Massaro Corporation would be given access to any data or information that may exist but said that this will be a total redesign and some of the data may be of little use. He advised that we certainly will share pertinent items such as surveys, core sampling reports, environmental studies and title information but said that we do not have the luxury of time needed in order to entertain a lot of different scenarios as far as design influence.

Mr. Cohen asked if the additional condition assessment of the existing garage structure has been completed and asked for an update on this report.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Oliphant and seconded by Ms. Qureshi, Resolution No. 59 of 2018 was approved as follows: Ms. Qureshi, yes; Ms. Oliphant, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

## **OLD/NEW BUSINESS**

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional new or old businesses for discussion.

There were none.

Mr. Cohen thanked the Authority staff for their work and wished each of them a happy holiday season.

The next Board meeting is scheduled for Thursday January 17, 2019 at 10:00 a.m.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:05 am with all Board Members in approval.

**APPROVED TO CONTENT**



---

**Chairman**

**ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF  
MINUTES**



---

**Approval**