

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
THURSDAY MAY 19, 2022**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a virtual meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:08 a.m. on May 19, 2022. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Matt Barron, Liz Fishback and Bobby Wilson. Mr. Cohen joined at 10:12 a.m. Present from staff were David Onorato, Chris Holt, Jo-Ann Williams, Mark DiNatale, David Perry, Tracy Sowinski, Karla Stanger, Scott McNaugher, Jana Williams and Patricia Konesky. Gwen Bolden joined at 10:13 a.m. Also present were Jason Wrona of Buchanan, Ingersoll & Rooney; Bill Stewart of Strategic Communications; and John Small and Alison Keating.

MINUTES

Mr. Barron asked for approval of the minutes from the April 22, 2022 meeting.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Wilson, the minutes were approved as follows: Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Barron asked if there were any public comments.

There were none.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on the flooding activity at the Mon Wharf that resulted in four days of closure to date in May and 24 days during this calendar year. He advised that the City Public Works department assisted in this month's clean-up effort, which took longer to clean than previously because of the heavy debris and soot was left behind when the water receded.

Mr. Onorato reminded the Board that the street cleaning program had begun and advised that only warning tickets would be issued during the first month of each neighborhood's cleaning cycle. He said that most of the few calls we received expressed support of the program.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the Parking Court mailed 2821 boot notices to individuals informing them that they were facing that penalty and explaining payment arrangements that would prevent their incurring additional fines.

Mr. Onorato advised that the intersection of Sixth Street and Penn Avenue has been closed by the city for reconstruction work. He said that we do not anticipate reopening of the site until the first week of June, adding that the closure is having a negative effect on parking at the Ft. Duquesne and Sixth Garage. He stated that with the Clemente Bridge also closed, customers of the garage are having difficulty navigating their way to its entrance.

Mr. Onorato advised that we are still working with PACT to determine our options to ensure that the Mellon Square Garage will be provided with steam heat this winter.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Finance Report, stating that the trend of 2022 revenues exceeding those from 2021 for both garage and meter operations is continuing. He noted that revenues are about 2.3 percent below budget but said that we did collect \$2 million in garage revenues and had a good month in meter performance as well. He advised that we are still monitoring expenses closely and keeping them at a minimum. Mr. Onorato advised that for the second consecutive month revenues exceeded \$3 million, specifically April at \$3.5 million and February at \$3.7 million. He advised that the 2019 revenues, 2021's base year for comparison, were \$4.9 million and that we are currently at approximately 60 percent of that earlier total. He said that the increases in meter revenue were moving a quicker pace than proceeds from the garages.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Facility Report, which he stated shows that all garage locations are seeing an increase in revenues from last year, above 60 percent of last year's total.

Mr. Onorato discussed the year-to-date Facility Report, which shows revenues of \$7.5 million, or approximately 58 percent of last year's target. He said last year's year-to-date result for the same period was \$4.8 million.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement Report, stating that to date 21,000 tickets were issued compared to 15,000 in 2021. He said 43 percent were meter and residential parking permit violations while 42 percent issued for street cleaning violations. He advised that the 9,031 tickets issued for street cleaning in May were given for warning purposes.

Mr. Cohen asked if the Authority had a way of tracking the means of payment favored by owners following the ticketing of their vehicles.

Mr. Onorato responded that we cannot connect a ticket to a payment method but said we do have a quarterly report which shows that just over 60 percent of parking transactions involve the use of a phone app, a practice which could indicate that the majority of the tickets may be issued using that means. He stated that with the Authority enforcement staff being shorthanded, there has been some difficulty with enforcement occurring evenly in all areas of the city. He stated that we are adjusting schedules to accommodate short staffing and said that while we are still trying to hire additional officers, we are having difficulty finding candidates. He advised

that we recently hired three new officers and said that we still hope to add at least another 10 to 12 as promptly as we can.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement Meter Revenue Report, which shows street collections of \$1.2 million included \$177,000 in the lots and lot lease revenues were \$27,000. He advised that April 2022 meter revenues were \$1.4 million and comparing that to 2019, the base year, when meter revenues were \$1.7 million, bringing us to almost 90 percent of the April 2019 total. He also stated that meter revenues increased 33 percent from last year noting that meter results are returning more rapidly to the pre-pandemic level than garages. He said the trend is understandable because drivers typically seek on-street spaces before committing to a garage location.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report, which he stated shows ticket fine collections of \$634,000 in 2021 and \$613,000 this year. He advised that the year-to-date total is \$2.3 million and stated that the collection total for the same time period in 2019 was \$2.1 million. He stated that Parking Court sent boot eligibility notices went out this week and stated that the action usually results in an increase in collections.

RESOLUTION NO. 13 OF MAY 2022, "A RESOLUTION RATIFYING AN EMERGENCY PROCUREMENT FOR CONTRACTING SERVICES NEEDED TO REPLACE THE EXISTING SUMP PUMP STATION AT THE OLIVER GARAGE, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the Oliver Garage is a sublevel facility with three levels being underground. He advised that after a recent rainstorm the bottom levels took on water up to three feet deep that was encroaching on the room housing equipment for the garage and the Piatt Place Apartments located above it. He stated that after the water was drained it was determined that the sump pump failed and would require replacement. He advised that due to their emergency nature the repairs needed to be made before there was time for the request for proposal process to be employed. He advised that we reached out to six different vendors, including our on-call plumbing contractor who reported he would be unable to assist us. He said one of the vendors was able to come on-site and confirm the need to replace the pump but said locating one pump for purchase was an issue. Mr. Onorato noted that the contractor was able to locate two of the type we needed in Texas, which we were able to purchase and receive within two days, adding that we had to continually pump water out from the basin during this period. He advised that the pumps have been replaced; the system has been tested and is working correctly. He advised that the six contractors contracted were Krupp-Whitney Plumbing; Carl Walker Construction; Nathan Contracting; Franjo Construction; Pittsburgh Restoration and F5 Facilities Services. He stated that, under the emergency repairs policy, we are seeking to compensate F5 Facilities Services in the amount of \$72,987.24.

Mr. Cohen asked if the Authority had insurance to cover this type of failure and if there was any damage to the garage itself that would require repair.

Mr. Onorato responded that we had not reviewed the situation from an insurance standpoint but will explore if the repair would be a covered item.

Mr. Cohen asked the name of our on-call plumber and asked why the firm was not able to perform the repair.

Mr. Onorato responded that our current plumbing contractor is Krupp Whitney Plumbing and advised that the on-call contract is ending at the end of this month. He said he was advised that they will not be bidding on the contract going forward as they do not have enough workers currently on staff and are having a hard time recruiting and hiring potential additions.

Mr. Cohen expressed surprise that none of the companies, including some that were awarded many contracts to over the years, was able to help us in this emergency.

Mr. Onorato stated that one of these companies did refer us to the firm that completed the repairs.

Mr. Holt advised that most of these companies had prior commitments and said they just could not break free the manpower needed to service us in this quick turnaround period. He also advised that the water build-up did no damages to the building.

Mr. Speers added that the Oliver Garage, a three-level-below-ground structure, is currently being utilized at about 55 percent of capacity and said that no vehicles are currently parking on the third level. He added that we did not lose any revenue because of the water problem.

Ms. Fishback asked the anticipated service life of the newly installed system and also how long the last system lasted.

Mr. Holt responded that the life expectancy of the new system is approximately 15 years, adding the system being replaced was the original one commissioned in 1998 when the facility was first built.

Mr. Barron asked if the Authority had ever done an analysis of all of our properties and explored how we may be able to work with PWSA, Alcosan and the City to begin committing to install some green infrastructure components. He mentioned that our facilities have a lot of concrete and suggested that we may be able find ways to break it up and install rain gardens and tree pits. He noted that while it wouldn't solve the problem entirely, it would possibly help reduce some of the stress on our mechanical systems following the really big rain events that climate change is likely to increase. He stated that it might be beneficial to do an analysis of that option and said there may be some funding source available, particularly given PSWA's requirement to correct its stormwater program.

Mr. Onorato responded that Mr. Barron's suggestion was a good one, adding that the preferred route before moving on to the garages might begin with our 32 surface lots and then move onto the garages. He stated that we did with PWSA several years ago during renovations of some of our surface lots. He said the work involved installing pits to address storm runoff.

Mr. Barron offered his assistance in connecting staff with the appropriate companies and individuals necessary.

Mr. Cohen agreed with Mr. Barron, stating that it is wise to take advantage of opportunities to make our facilities green. He asked if this was a subject that could be looked at on an annual basis to explore if upgrades of this nature should be addressed.

Mr. Onorato responded that we contract for annual inspections for structural reasons with an outside engineering firm but noted that our project management personnel also do general inspections of the lots throughout the year as part of their routine seasonal work. He noted that problems such as this sump pump failure would not have surfaced because the pumps are located underground.

Mr. Holt added that we currently are in the process of obtaining a new on-call plumbing service and said specifications being built into the RFP call for bi-annual inspection of sump pump systems to make sure they are properly functioning.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 13 of 2022 was approved as follows: Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 14 OF MAY 2022, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO UTILIZE ELEVATOR/ESCALATOR MAINTENANCE SERVICES AT THE WOOD-ALLIES PARKING GARAGE FROM THE CITY OF PITTSBURGH CONTRACT WITH OTIS ELEVATOR, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the elevators under discussion are located at the Wood-Allies Garage. He advised of the facility's three banks of elevators have recently had many service failures, including entrapments, due to the door mechanisms not functioning properly. He advised that we are looking to install new tracks, hangers, tracking mechanisms, gate switches, sensors and door openers to remedy the problem. He said a total of 31 elevator doors being replaced, three on each level and one in the basement and advised that we are looking to piggy-back on the City and County contract with Otis Elevator Company at a cost not to exceed \$159,000, or approximately \$4,600 per door.

Ms. Fishback asked if we knew the cost to replace an entire elevator, including the shaft, and asked is there any advantages replacing the entire units and not just the doors.

Mr. Holt responded that we rely on the state inspections and our elevator contractor to determine

the overall condition of each elevator and said we use this information to prioritize repair or replacement decisions as part of our Capital Budget process. He noted that the elevators are currently rated as being in good condition and stated that replacing just those that are failing should extend the life of entire units that we have scheduled to be fully modernized in about three years. He advised that to replace one entire elevator, including the shaft component, would cost between \$.5 million and \$1.0 million and would take approximately 12 months per facility.

Mr. Cohen stated that would equate to approximately \$300,000 to \$350,000 per shaft and asked the total number of elevators across the Authority system.

Mr. Holt confirmed that estimate and advised that, system-wide there are 27 elevators and one escalator. He advised that there are two garages, Smithfield/Liberty and Ft. Duquesne and Sixth, are scheduled for complete elevator modernization in 2023 and 2024, respectively.

Mr. Onorato added that our Capital Budget provides for elevator repair and total replacement on a rolling basis.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Wilson, Resolution No. 14 of 2022 was approved as follows: Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 15 OF MAY 2022, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO EXTEND THE HOURS OF ENFORCEMENT IN THE SOUTH SIDE TO MATCH THE HOURS OF THE PARKING ENHANCEMENT DISTRICT (PED) AND TO IMPLEMENT TICKET-BY-MAIL IN THE LOTS AND ON-STREETS IN THE SOUTH SIDE, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato asked if all Board members were familiar with the Enhancement District concept reminded them the Authority has one such PED located in the South Side. He stated that prior to its adoption all on-street meters were enforced Monday through Saturday from 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. He advised that within PED boundaries, however, metered parking is enforced from 8:00 a.m. to 12:00 midnight Monday through Saturday, with revenue for all segments after 6:00 being held by the City Finance Department for subsequent transfer to the South Side Community Organization for reinvestment within community. He explained that this community share is distributed net of Authority enforcement expense. He advised that this resolution adds Sunday as an enforcement day and said we also want to adjust operations in our surface lots to match PED enforcement hours in effect on Thursdays through Sundays. He reported that the resolution was accompanied by letters from City Council in support of the proposed change. Mr. Onorato also advised that we are in the process of implementing a pilot ticket-by-mail process in our South Side surface lots to prove the value of the program before applying considering its application to on-street meters. He advised that we see ticket-by-mail as another component of a

broader initiative to improve officer safety. He said safety measures began with reducing enforcement hours in the South Side due to the increase in violence in the area and said this reduction of coverage will continue until the police resume escorting our officers on their Rounds. He noted that the City Administration is aware of this. He advised that implementing the ticket-by-mail approach would not only is it a more efficient operation it also a big step forward for the safety of the officers as they will no longer need to exit their vehicles to place a ticket on a vehicle's windshield or interact with the public.

Ms. Fishback thanked Mr. Onorato for explaining the background of PED and asked if our concerns regarding workforce could reduce our ability to expand enforcement hours.

Mr. Onorato said that the expanded hours would be difficult to cover currently, adding that even though we are not enforcing after 6:00 pm for safety reasons, having the meters in enforcement mode can encourage parkers to pay for stays. He stated that City Council is aware of this practice and supports it. He noted, however, that revenue and compliance would both increase if we were to enforce until midnight.

Mr. Cohen asked how the ticket-by-mail program would function.

Mr. Onorato responded that an officer would drive a camera-equipped vehicle to scan license plates for compliance. He advised that the next day those in violation would be downloaded to Duncan together with the supporting photos and said Duncan would then contact the Department of Transportation for the address of the vehicle's registered owner, and a ticket would be mailed to the owner. Mr. Onorato said the collection process would be completed when the ticket is mailed to the owner and payment occurs.

Mr. Cohen asked if there would be any grace time would be part of the collection process.

Mr. Onorato advised that there will be a five-minute grace time on all meter transactions. He also said that the times for contesting or payment of a ticket would be adjusted to include the time spent having to mail the ticket.

Mr. Wilson asked Mr. Onorato to explain if the ticket-by-mail program was legal.

Mr. Onorato replied that it is legal in the lots because the Authority owns them, adding that he expects that when the procedure is proven successful and brought back to the Board with on-street recommendations, we will have done our due diligence to make sure it is legal under City and State law. He noted that he learned at a recent Pennsylvania Parking Conference that the city of Reading has already adopted by-mail ticketing for street cleaning enforcement.

Mr. Barron stated that he is very supportive of the program and will certainly vote to implement it, noting that he has had discussions with South Side residents who reported the PED enforcement has already made a difference that's positive and real. He also stated that he was approached by Councilwoman Gross who stated she is really interested in pursuing a similar program in her Lawrenceville district, an area that is experiencing some of the same parking challenges being faced on the South Side. He said he advised her to reach out to Mr. Onorato.

Mr. Onorato advised that Councilwoman Gross did reach out to him and said that we would support the addition but not without concerns regarding staffing. He also advised that it is City Council's role to implement this type of program in any of its district neighborhoods. He stated that once expansion was approved in Council our involvement would be to enforce any changes. Mr. Onorato asked if Mr. Wilson if he and Councilwoman Gross would advocate for the ticket-by-mail concept as that would help dramatically with the adoption of the program in their areas. He also noted that Councilwoman Gross asked if the PED-type governance, reporting that that the program could cover the entire day as funds for that purposed are already pledged to the City.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 15 of 2022 was approved as follows: Mr. Barron, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any new or old business matters to discuss. He then asked members thoughts on returning to in-person Board meetings.

Mr. Onorato advised that with the current increase in COVID cases, said he thought it would be best to continue to hold the meetings on the virtual platform and asked the Board if they were in agreement with that proposal.


Mr. Barron and Ms. Fishback said they supported virtual meetings at least through June. Ms. Fishback said she will be out of town then and noted that it is much easier to participate on the virtual level when you're away.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any additional new or old business matters to discuss.

There were none.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:53 a.m. with all Board members in approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT

DocuSigned by:

Chairman

**ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF
MINUTES**

DocuSigned by:
Liz Fishback
46168AFA0D894D6...
Approval
