

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
THURSDAY DECEMBER 15, 2022**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a virtual meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 9:02 a.m. on December 15, 2022. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Jeff Cohen, Bobby Wilson, Liz Fishback and Kimberly Lucas. Present from staff were David Onorato, Christopher Speers, Chris Holt, Gwen Bolden, Mark DiNatale, David Perry, Scott McNaugher, Kathryn Van Why, Matt Engleson, Karla Turzak and Patricia Konesky. Also present were Jason Wrona of Buchanan, Ingersoll & Rooney, Bill Stewart of Strategic Communications and Alison Keating.

MINUTES

Mr. Cohen asked for approval of the minutes from the November 17, 2022 meeting.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Wilson, the minutes were approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Lucas, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any public comments.

There were none.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato thanked Mr. Wilson for arranging a City Council ceremony declaring November 19, 2022 as Monique Jackson Day in the City. He reminded the Board that Ms. Jackson is a Parking Enforcement Officer who went above and beyond the call of duty by assisting in saving the lives of city residents while on duty. He advised that she was duly recognized in front of Council and said that he wanted to thank Mr. Wilson for organizing that dedication. He advised that Ms. Jackson truly appreciated both the Parking Authority and the City for acknowledging her actions.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board of two Mon Wharf incidents earlier in the week when homeless tent encampments caught fire. He said that the fire department arrived promptly on both occasions and extinguished the fires. He reported that he is in the process of having the tents removed from the site to preserve safety of our parkers and to prevent damage to the highways above the Wharf location.

Mr. Cohen asked if Mr. Onorato had any response from the City regarding the situation at

the Mon Wharf with the homeless and the fires.

Mr. Onorato advised that he did send an email last night to the City administration which replied that his message had been forwarded onto the appropriate parties. He advised that he is awaiting responses from any individuals or organization included in that group.

Mr. Cohen stated that from a fire standpoint the entire parkway could be affected and said he believes some pressure should be put on the administration because of the possibility of damage to the City's transportation structure.

Mr. Onorato stated that he requested assistance from Public Works Department in removing the homeless encampments, noting a recent news report that the City removed similar encampments from the North Side. He stated that if he gets no pledges of assistance, we would move forward and have the encampments removed.

Mr. Wilson responded that the news reports were not entirely complete. He advised that the occupants of those encampments had been connected to indoor sites prior to any removal action being taken. He stated that if the situation which is occurring at the Wharf is a safety issue that definitely should require the involvement of the City administration. He stated he is not comfortable just removing any encampment without consideration of the fate of its occupants.

Mr. Onorato responded that he did copy Ms. Drogowski from the City and Mr. Palka from AHN who coordinate the City's response to issues of this nature. He noted that the intensity of the fire was sufficient enough to require an inspection from an outside engineering firm to see if there was structural damage to the overpass.

Mr. Wilson stated that when a person's house burns down there are people and organizations available to connect them to remedial locations alluding to this needs to occur for the homeless at the Mon Wharf.

Mr. Onorato responded that he appreciates what Mr. Wilson is saying and stated that we certainly will work cooperatively with advocate of the homeless. He explained that our customers' vehicles park on the Wharf and we would be responsible for damage resulting from their presence there. He also noted that any fire located under the stairwell would cause concern for PennDot regarding the structural integrity of the Parkway above it.

Mr. Wilson responded that yesterday was a pretty busy day for those that Mr. Onorato reached out to, which may be why there was no immediate response. He advised that he will reach out the appropriate personnel to try to get this moving along.

Mr. Cohen mentioned that his concern is that when Mr. Onorato sends an email regarding the importance of this issue that it at least be responded to. He advised that an email was sent a week ago after the first fire and no response was received.

Mr. Onorato advised that 95 percent of meters in Phase two of the upgrade have been installed with only about 10 to 15 meters requiring attention. He advised that those units are in the warehouse, pending completions of on-going construction in the areas they will be located. He advised that they will be installed immediately upon completion of the construction activity.

Mr. Onorato advised that we are continuing to work with Duquesne Light and the City at our Second Avenue Lot to electrify our Second Avenue surface lot with meters and solar panels. He advised that Duquesne Light is coordinating the paperwork for submission for the grant opportunities.

Mr. Cohen asked if the Authority pays Duquesne Light directly or if we have a different supplier for our electricity costs. He advised that we should check our kilowatt rate and move to a lower-cost supplier even if the change is of a short-term duration.

Mr. Holt responded that the Authority receive its energy supply through Duquesne Light and said we are part of a group formed by the City to receive bulk rates.

Mr. DiNatale advised that we did anticipate this rate increase and have accounted for it in the budget.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Finance Reports, which showed \$3.4 million in revenues for November compared to \$3.1 million earned a month earlier. He noted that the 2019 base year totals was just over \$4 million. He advised that year-to-date revenues total \$38 million, up from \$30 million last year but still less than 2019's \$53 million. He advised that our budget projection through November was \$36 million meaning that we are slightly ahead of the budget to date. He added that he believes we will be able to attain the \$39 million budgeted total for the year.

Mr. Onorato discussed the second Finance Report, a monthly increase of revenues by month, a report created as a result of Covid, which shows over \$3 million in revenue gains since March and through November. He stated that while we are having a decent year, we remain lower than pre-pandemic levels but trending in the right direction. He noted that we still need the major companies to return downtown and for their employees to resume traditional levels of garage parking.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Facilities Report, stating that all revenues shown are the same as on the Finance Reports. He stated that revenues at the Forbes Semple Garage are down in direct proportion to the loss of 185 to 200 spaces per day due to construction. He advised that he anticipates volume will return to normal after the work is completed. Mr. Onorato discussed the year-to-date report, which he said shows that the effects of Forbes-Semple are just starting to be realized. He advised that total revenue this year is \$22 million compared to \$17 million through November a year ago.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement Report, stating that 192,000 tickets have been issued year to date, or about 38,000 more than last year. He said he attributes the increase directly to the resumption of enforcing street cleaning. He advised that 38 percent of tickets issued were for

meter violations and said those, combined with street cleaning and residential permit parking violations, equals 79 percent of our total violations. Mr. Onorato reported that he was pleased that the Authority was able to maintain all of its other enforcement numbers despite the assumption of street cleaning coverage and the continued reduction in staffing level. He advised that we remain aggressive in the posting of both enforcement and garage openings but are continuing to have difficulty in filling those positions.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Meter Revenue Report, noting that there was a total of \$1.193 million in meter revenues for the month, slightly up from \$1.185 million recorded in November 2021 are now just \$300,000 off. He stated that meter revenue is returning faster to pre-pandemic levels than revenues from the garages. He noted again that meter result are moving to pre-pandemic levels more rapidly than garages.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report, stating that the revenues are directly related to the increase of tickets issued by enforcement. He advised that we are projecting approximately \$8.3 million in gross Parking Court Revenues for all of 2022, up about \$400,000 from last year's total.

Ms. Lucas asked that based on the reports, if revenue has increased in all areas except those affected by construction.

Mr. Onorato responded that our garages volume is 35-to-45 percent off its traditional pace and is holding steady at that rate. He advised that pre-covid garage use was typically 98-to-99 percent of capacity system-wide and currently is at about 63 percent. He advised that this is appropriate \$20 million below 2019's garage revenue pace, noting that meter volume is down \$5 million from the base year total.

RESOLUTION NO. 46 OF DECEMBER 2022, "A RESOLUTION ACKNOWLEDGING MR. ROBERT MOBLEY FOR HIS 20 YEARS OF PROFESSIONAL AND EXEMPLARY SERVICE IN HIS EMPLOYMENT WITH THE PITTSBURGH PARKING AUTHORITY, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that shortly after his start date, Mr. Mobley was assigned to the Shadyside Garage where he remained throughout his tenure at the Parking Authority. He reported that his long service there earned Mr. Mobley the affectionate title of Mayor of Shadyside and the residents know him on a personal basis. Mr. Onorato stated that Mr. Mobley's reputation for customer service was above and beyond normal levels and said he will be missed not only by his Authority peers but also by the Shadyside residents. He stated that we wish Mr. Mobley well in his future endeavors and a long and fruitful retirement.

Mr. Cohen stated that in today's society most people do not stay at one job for 20 years and stated that he wished that we could clone Mr. Mobley's performance during his Authority tenure.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Wilson, Resolution No. 46 of 2022 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Lucas, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 47 OF DECEMBER 2022, “A RESOLUTION ACKNOWLEDGING MR. JOEL HELFAND FOR HIS 28 YEARS OF PROFESSIONAL AND EXEMPLARY SERVICE IN HIS EMPLOYMENT WITH THE PITTSBURGH PARKING AUTHORITY, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that Mr. Helfand has been employed by the Authority for 28 years both at several of the downtown garages and also as a steward representing Local 926 where he represented his members well. He advised that Mr. Helfand participated in a few negotiation sessions and stated that he was always a stand-up person who worked well with the Authority’s management team. Mr. Onorato stated that he was well respected by his peers, and stated that we wish him well in his retirement.

Mr. Cohen stated that between Mr. Helfand and Mr. Mobley 50 years of experience is leaving us. He asked if there are strategies in place to fill their absences.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority is continuing to recruit quality personnel, but again, noted the difficulties in hiring at this time.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Ms. Lucas, Resolution No. 47 of 2022 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Lucas, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 48 OF DECEMBER 2022, “A RESOLUTION ACKNOWLEDGING MRS. JANET STAAB FOR HER 23 YEARS OF PROFESSIONAL AND EXEMPLARY SERVICE IN HER EMPLOYMENT WITH THE PITTSBURGH PARKING AUTHORITY, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that Mrs. Staab is a non-union employee, unlike the two recognized in the previous resolutions, and she has been a steady and calming fixture in our Finance department for 23 years. He stated that she would surely be missed, not only from her knowledge and

attention to details, but for the quality of the relationships and friendships she built throughout the office.

Mr. Onorato stated that he personally will miss seeing Mrs. Staab in the office each day, not only for the work she does but for her friendship as well. He wished her a healthy and happy retirement.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Cohen, Resolution No. 48 of 2022 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Lucas, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 49 OF DECEMBER 2022, “ A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE A CHANGE ORDER AND FINAL PAYMENT TO ALLEGHENY CITY ELECTRIC, INC. FOR THE REPLACEMENT OF LIGHT POLES AND FIXTURES AT THE IVY-BELLEFONTE SURFACE LOT, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato reminded the Board of a recent storm that caused two light poles in this lot to fall, damaging a few parked vehicles. He said that upon inspection all of the light fixtures in the facility needed replaced. Mr. Onorato advised that a contract was issued to Allegheny City Electric to perform the work. He advised that the firm was able to determine that some of the concrete pads were in better shape than anticipated, and therefore was able to complete the repairs and also issue a \$8,000.00 credit, a 12-percent reduction in the original contract amount. He said we asking for authorization to release final payment in the amount of \$54,969.08.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Lucas and seconded by Mr. Cohen, Resolution No. 49 of 2022 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Lucas, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 50 OF DECEMBER 2022, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO INCREASE TRANSIENT PARKING RATES AND EXPAND ENFORCEMENT HOURS AT THE FIVE (5) AUTHORITY-OWNED LOTS IN THE SOUTH SIDE DISTRICT, was read by Mr. Cohen and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority has been working with Councilman Kraus's office and the Public Safety Director on matter involving the South Side PED. He reported that both offices already approved a rate increase from \$2.00 to \$3.00 per hour during PED periods and increase the PED hours of enforcement from midnight to 3:00 a.m. when they are in effect. He noted that this program is in place only on Thursday, Friday, Saturday and Sunday evenings and said both daytime restrictions and current hourly rate of \$2.00 will remained unchanged.

Ms. Lucas asked how this rate compares to the meter rates on the street.

Mr. Onorato responded that the on-street meter rates in this area are \$2.00 per hour but during PED hours will rise to \$3.00 per hour. He advised that the City already approved the \$3.00-per- hour for the PED and said we will be matching it in the lots.

Ms. Lucas stated that lots normally charge a lower rate than on-street spaces to encourage people to utilize them, but she stated that she is fine with supporting this resolution.

Mr. Onorato responded that her thinking is correct on the matter but said that there has been a lot of concern with evening parking due to the amount of people attending the various South Side establishments.

He advised that many patrons operate differently from other entertainment locations and remain in the lots after the bars close, which is why the 3:00 a.m. enforcement time was implemented.

Ms. Lucas noted that she is aware that there has been some security concerns for the officers in that area and asked if we are moving forward with using additional cameras for enforcement.

Mr. Onorato advised that we are working with Wise-Sight on implementation of ticketing-by-mail coverage in the South Side lots and noted that we are going to continue to work with Council and the City to see if we can implement that concept for street enforcement a well. He noted that we continue to enforce at night time only when the Police can escort our officers for safety protection. He stated that once ticketing by mail is in place, officer protection would no longer be required because monitoring would be by cameras with tickets being mailed to violators of parking restriction.

Mr. Cohen asked if there will be a grace period. during the start-up period of the new enforcement concept.

Mr. Onorato advised that there will be a 30-minute grace period on the front end and advised that the signage in the lots will be posted to inform the parking public of the change.

Mr. Cohen asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Ms. Lucas, Resolution No. 50 of 2022 was approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Ms. Lucas, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes; Mr. Cohen, yes.

NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Onorato wished everyone a Happy Holiday and Merry Christmas.

Mr. Cohen asked if there was any additional new or old business matters to discuss.

There were none.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:39 a.m. with all Board members in approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT

DocuSigned by:
Jeff Cohen
BBEEASE50F8346C...
Chairman

ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF MINUTES

DocuSigned by:
J. Fish
1970ED52F74B42D...
Approval