

# **MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH THURSDAY DECEMBER 19, 2024**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a virtual meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:05 a.m. on December 19, 2024. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Liz Fishback, Bobby Wilson, Kim Lucas Bob Palmosina and Sean Luther. Present from staff were David Onorato, Christopher Speers, Jodi Hart, JoAnn Williams, Matt Jendrzewski, Scott McNaugher, David Perry, Bob Wilson, Karla Turzak, Hanna Rupenski, Karla Howell, Matt Engleson, Joshua Shepherd and Patricia Konesky. Also present were Nathan Clark of Buchanan, Ingersoll & Rooney, Tim Schooley, James Hill, Denise Moschak and Alison Keating.

## **MINUTES**

Ms. Fishback asked for approval of the minutes from the November 21, 2024, meeting.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Palmosina the minutes were approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, abstain.

## **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any public comments.

There were none.

## **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Mr. Onorato advised that an Executive Session was held on December 4, 2024, to discuss personnel issues and real estate transactions.

Mr. Onorato advised that 3,327 boot eligibility notices were sent to registered vehicle owners to advise them of their boot eligibility and to give them time to make arrangements to avoid booting and towing.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Parking Court Agreement was extended while we are preparing an RFP to be issued for this service.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that there is a water leak under the trestle into the Greyhound area at the Grant Street Transportation Center which has caused a mold issue and advised that it is our responsibility for repairs. He advised that it appears to be a very difficult fix and advised that he will keep the Board posted on the progress of the repairs.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Finance Report, stating that November was a relatively good month with revenues totaling \$3.9 million, up \$100,000 from the same time last year and the 2019 base year of \$4.5 million. He advised that the budget year-to-date is \$46.1 million and our estimates for 2024 year-to-date is \$46.1. He also advised that revenues at the same time last year were \$43.6 million with the 2019 base year being \$53.3 million. He advised that our 2024 budget through November is \$43.6 million up about 5.6 % based on our budget.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Garage Facility Report, showing revenues of \$2.3 million in November 2024 compared to \$2.2 million the previous year. He advised that the big decrease is in the Mellon Square Garage revenues where we are losing approximate 230 spaces a day due to the on-going construction, which is progressing smoothly and on-schedule. He advised that year-to-date garage revenue is \$25.6 million compared to \$24.6 million last year through November and is up approximately 4%.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement and Meter Report, stating that there were 21,000 tickets issued in November 2024 compared to 17,000 tickets issued in November 2023. He advised that there were 220,000 tickets issued year-to-date, up almost 15,000 tickets from the previous year. He advised that approximately 50% of the total tickets issued were for meter violations, and 12% being ticket by mail through the Automotus Smart Loading Zone Program and the stationary camera enforcement program by Wise Sight in the two South Side Lots. He advised that the meter revenue is coming back faster than the garages from 2019 base year revenue, with street meter revenues year-to-date being \$1.3 million which is higher than the 2019 figures, lot collections is \$182,000 slightly below 2019 and lot leases are slightly up at \$31,000 compared to 2019. He advised that for the month of November 2024 revenues were \$1.5 million compared to \$1.4 million in 2019 and significantly up from November 2023.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report, which he stated reflects the same trend as the Meter reports with November 2024 revenues were \$883,000 compared to \$839,000 in November 2023 and year-to-date revenues at \$9,130,000 compared to 2023 of \$9,188,000 and stated we are hoping to close that gap and meet 2024 revenues when the December revenue numbers come in.

Ms. Fishback congratulated the Parking Authority team noting that revenues keep ticking up and surpassing the 2019 baseline numbers and thanked everyone for all their hard work in bringing the Authority back financially from Covid.

**RESOLUTION NO. 41 OF DECEMBER 2024, “A RESOLUTION  
AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE  
AUTHORITY TO NEGOTIATE, ENTER INTO, AND  
EFFECTUATE AN AGREEMENT FOR THE PURCHASE AND**

**SALE OF REAL PROPERTY (THE “AGREEMENT”) WITH  
THE PITTSBURGH TRUST FOR CULTURAL RESOURCES  
D/B/A THE PITTSBURGH CULTURAL TRUST (THE “TRUST”).**  
was read by Ms. Fishback and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board that we have been in discussion with the Cultural Trust for approximately 6 months or longer regarding the possible sale of the Ninth and Penn footprint where we had a garage prior to covid, which has just been a vacant site since 2019. He advised that the Mayor’s vision is to make that a green space with park-like amenities for the entire block of Eighth and Ninth Street. He advised that working with City to make sure the Mayor’s vision comes to fruition. An appraisal was completed and agreed to a general term sheet with selling the property for \$3.5 million which is above the appraised value of \$3,330,000. He also advised that the term sheet included the clause that if the Cultural Trust were to sell our footprint anytime in the next twenty years, and make a profit on the sale, the Authority would receive 25% of any increase in revenues received from the sale of the property. He also noted that we would have a right of first refusal if any part of the property became a garage. He also noted that all requirements of our Trust and covenants will be met with the sale of this property.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

Mr. Wilson thanked Mr. Onorato for working through this complicated process. He stated that he has seen some of the designs for this area and is looking forward to this becoming a reality as he feels it is needed to have something other than Point State Park that has more of those type of amenities including those designed for children. He stated that as the city moves to having more residential families move Downtown, hopefully this will attract families from around the region. He stated that he appreciates everything that the Authority worked through to get this completed and wanted to recognize the Authority so not to be forgotten that this was one of the Authority’s biggest generating garages.

Mr. Onorato stated that when this facility was operational prior to covid it generated approximately \$2 million net profit per year. He stated that based on revenues it was not our largest facility, but it was the only facility we had in the heart of the Trust. He advised that it has been down since 2019, when it was demolished with plans to build a new garage, but since covid the demand for parking in the garages has diminished. He stated that we will continue to look at alternate sites in the area for potential development in the area.

Mr. Onorato also noted that he as well has seen some initial plans but wanted to note that once we sell the property, we will not be involved in the design process. He advised that this will be at the discretion of the City and the Cultural Trust.

Mr. Luther also added that he realizes that this was a complicated process to get completed and he stated that Mr. Onorato and staff demonstrated exceptional leadership and really have shown how effective partnerships in Pittsburgh are. He stated he is very excited and believes that this deal works for well for the Authority,

Downtown and the Mayor's vision. He stated that he is excited for the plan and will make sure that the Authority's contributions to this next wave of development Downtown will remain presence, and he thanked Mr. Onorato for getting this completed.

Ms. Fishback thanked the Cultural Trust as well, noting that it is the responsibility of the Board to ensure the fiduciary health of this independent Authority and to ensure that any decisions the Board makes now do us well now as well as in the future. She thanked Mr. Onorato and the Authority team for getting this where it needed to be.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any additional questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Ms. Lucas, Resolution No. 41 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 42 OF DECEMBER 2024, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO NEGOTIATE AND EXECUTE THE FOURTH AMENDMENT TO THE MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING BETWEEN THE AUTHORITY AND AUTOMOTUS, INC. ("AUTOMOTUS"),** was read by Mr. Wilson and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board that years ago the City applied for a grant for a smart loading zone pilot program, which was \$1,000 for approximately twenty spaces, and since it involved curbside management, the City reached out to us to help manage this program. He advised that it has been very successful, and we have expanded the number of spaces, which includes up to fifty-six cameras, not only on the loading zones, but it expanded into the bike lanes. He advised that with this enforcement, we are hoping to see an increase in the compliance and have been asked by the City to completely take over the management of this program and remove both DOMI and the City from the operational aspects. He stated that we are asking for approval to extend the contract using SourceWell, based on the terms and conditions in the resolution of \$49,000 annually for license fee and a per camera fee of \$4,200. He noted that in the last several months we have seen enough revenue in ticket fines for this violation to cover these costs and the expansion of the camera.

Mr. Wilson asked Mr. Onorato to detail how a ticket is given under this program.

Mr. Onorato advised that the purple loading zones are covered by stationary camera mounted on

poles and if an individual pulls into that area and is in violation, not enrolled in the program, the parking session is recorded by the cameras and downloaded and a ticket is sent via mail from Duncan, our Parking Court management company, to the vehicle's registered owner.

Mr. Wilson asked if payment compliance for these tickets is good.

Mr. Onorato responded that the ticket received has a photo of the vehicle at the time of violation, with the date, time and location and he believes that the photos are playing a key part in the payments being rather than contesting. He also thanked DOMI as they were a huge success in getting this program up and running.

Ms. Lucas thanked Mr. Onorato for their partnership and mentioned that this program won a World Economics Forum Award for this year for curb management to create safer streets and mentioned that when there is curb space available it eliminates double parking and makes the roadways safer.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Ms. Lucas, Resolution No. 42 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 43 OF DECEMBER 2024, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH MAHER DUESSEL FOR INDEPENDENT AUDIT SERVICES,** was read by Ms. Lucas and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the current contract with Maher Duessel expires at the end of this year. He advised that we entered this contract along with the city for their auditing services. He advised that we are asking approval to enter a three-year contract with two one-year options at an annual cost of \$45,000.00. He noted that we are required by our Trust to have an audit completed by outside auditors.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Palmosina and seconded by Mr. Luther, Resolution No. 43 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes;

Ms. Fishback, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 44 OF DECEMBER 2024, “A RESOLUTION ADOPTING THE REGULARLY SCHEDULED PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH’S BOARD OF DIRECTORS’ MEETING DATES FOR 2025,** was read by Mr. Luther and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this resolution was held over from last month’s meeting so that we could poll the Board members to see the best date and times that was most convenient for the majority of the members. He mentioned that in doing so it was determined that the current schedule, the third Thursday of each month at 10:00 a.m. worked best. He also advised that the June 2025 meeting date falls on a holiday so an alternate date will be selected for the June meeting at some point in the future as we near that date.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Luther and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, Resolution No. 44 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

**RESOLUTION NO. 45 OF DECEMBER 2024, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO UTILIZE ELEVATOR/ESCALATOR MAINTENANCE SERVICES AT THE FORBES SEMPLE PARKING GARAGE FROM THE CITY OF PITTSBURGH CONTRACT WITH OTIS ELEVATOR COMPANY,** was read by Ms. Fishback and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Forbes Semple Garage has two elevators and both have been showing wear and tear on the door mechanism, causing both elevators to be down for several days last week. He advised that this outage caused problems for patrons as this is an eight-story facility and with no elevators in service caused a real inconvenience to our customers. At this time only one elevator is currently running. He advised that we are looking to upgrade both elevator doors to include new door tracks, hangers, steel seals, locking mechanisms and sensors at a cost not-to-exceed \$78,900 by piggybacking off the City of Pittsburgh’s contract with Otis Elevator.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, Resolution No. 45 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

## **OLD BUSINESS**

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any old business matters to discuss.

There were none.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any new business matters to discuss.

Mr. Wilson stated that he wanted to recognize that there was a resolution previously on the agenda and scheduled for today's meeting but that it was not on the agenda at the start of the meeting.

Mr. Onorato stated that based on the letter that Mr. Wilson himself sent to Mr. Onorato and the Board an hour before the meeting asking that the resolution be taken off the agenda, it was removed.

Mr. Wilson stated that he was not sure if it needed to be formally addressed, but that there was a letter, signed by all of City Council, and stated that they are looking for a very engaging conversation and there was a timeline put on the request. He advised that the city residency requirement is not only important to the Authority, but to the City also, as he stated that the City could not run if it was not for the Parking Authority and he was looking forward to further engagement with Mr. Onorato and the Board Members so we can have a more understanding of how we can fill vacant positions and stated he is looking forward to those discussions.

Ms. Fishback added that these discussions have been on-going for about a year and she looks forward to continuing them. She also thanked Mr. Onorato for pulling this resolution under such short notice.

Ms. Fishback asked if there was any other new business for discussion.

There were none.

Ms. Fishback wished everybody a safe, healthy and happy holiday season and a happy new year.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:41 a.m. with all the Board expressing their approval.

**APPROVED TO CONTENT**

DocuSigned by:

*Elizabeth Fishback*

Chairman

**ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF  
MINUTES**

Signed by:

*R/L*

Approval